

R. Wayne Shoaf, The Schoenberg Discography. Berkeley, CA: Fallen Leaf Press, 1986. Pp. ix + 200. Paper, \$19.95.

R. Wayne Shoaf is assistant archivist of the Arnold Schoenberg Institute at the University of Southern California and the compiler of a recent Horn Discography. With his special interest in the composer, his ready access to extensive record collections, and some experience in discography, this promises to be a significant contribution to the field.

Shoaf has not neglected to consult previous work on the subject. His bibliography lists 29 earlier discographies of varying degrees of completeness, as well as virtually all of the indexes, encyclopedias, national catalogues, review magazines, and similar sources that should be consulted.

The layout is logical, starting with the series of opus numbers, then continuing with other works by categories (opera, choral, orchestral, chamber, songs, keyboard, canons, and transcriptions). Each entry gives artists (including every known person in ensembles), timing and date of recording, followed by every issue number and its release date. The 12" LP is normative, but every conceivable recording mode and format is included and specified, including EvaTone Soundsheet. The discography occupies 91 pages.

My continued preference for chronological order under each work (rather than alphabetical order, as here) seems to be more valid here than usual, for Schoenberg's varied and unusual performing forces lend themselves poorly to alphabetizing. Op. 4 goes by ensemble (except for one version done by a group of individuals). The orchestral version of Op. 4 goes by conductor (except for two versions without any, as also in the case of Op. 9). Op. 29 goes by conductor, oddly enough, for three versions in this case have none. The index of artists by opus number does a better job of juxtaposing all multiple versions by any artist, not just those who happen to be the indexing name in each composition.

A 42-page appendix gives an index of reviews (Kurtz Myers style) by label and number. A 23-page index of names includes in one alphabet not only artists but text authors, dedicatees, and other names which occur in context. An 8-page title index makes the discography accessible. Introductory material clarifies the compiler's method, although the work is so sensible that one can go directly to the discography.

There is very little to quibble about here. Shoaf lists the composer's Prelude to Nat Shilkret's Genesis Suite with issue numbers from Artist and Capitol. Technically, this is all he had to do; but since such a basic reference work as Myers' Index to Record Reviews indicates that these were separate recordings (a fault of the reviewers who didn't bother to clarify the matter when the Capitol LP was issued), Shoaf might have pointed out, as he told me, that he determined the LP to be a reissue by listening to both. It's good to settle this question at last.

Less fortunate, Shoaf has merged Stokowski's two recordings of Verklarte Nacht into one list. The solo players identified on the RCA recording of February 1952 can hardly be on the Capitol (later Seraphim and Angel CD) stereo recording issued in May 1958.

On the other hand, finding the Australian pressings of the Columbia History of Music by Eye and Ear, Shoaf listed Erica Storm's song from Op. 15 as a 1923 recording, citing the English and American numbers as "pre-1942". This must have been recorded about the time as its flip side was made (June 1938), and he might have guessed that this was no acoustic recording.

Shoaf missed Lydia Majlingova's record of all the piano music on Opus 9111 0657 (about 1979), Valeri Spasski's version of Op. 5 on Melodiya (I only have the Eterna number, 827123), and Günther Herbig's Op. 16 and Op. 31 on Eterna 827898. He omits the shellac LP of Stokowski's Gurrelieder (LM 127, recorded two days earlier than the 78s). That's a pretty short list of omissions, and the list of inclusions is remarkably full.

There are a few inaccuracies. Shoaf makes two lines out of Hans Rosbaud's Op. 31 on 2549 008 (one for Helidor, one for Wergo); also listing the same number (as D.G.) under Karajan's version of the same work is an error. He includes Op. 46 in Eterna 825 201, but it was also included (as were Op. 9 and Op. 13) in 820 201, which must date from 1960. He lists Op. 9 under Victor Desarzens as Westminster C 30 A 453; there seems to be no such recording, and the number belongs under Op. 4 (where C 30 A 455 is listed in error).

Although he has a remarkably full list of recording dates, Shoaf might have looked further for dates of recordings made during the composer's lifetime, such as Ormandy's first Op. 4 (January 1935?), Golschmann's Op. 4 (1945?), Martha Lipton's "Song of the Wood-Dove" (November 28, 1949), the Hollywood String Quartet's Op. 4 (see this

Journal, XIV/2), Zillig's Op. 5 (September 1949), Sanromà's Op. 19 (reviewed in ARG in May 1940), Dervaux's Op. 9 (reviewed in Disques in November 1949), and Ellen Adler's Op. 41 (reviewed in Disques in March 1950). Paul Jacob's first traversal of the piano music on Ducretet-Thomson was reviewed in Disques in September 1958; he recorded some of the pieces for Véga in the Sixties, but I wish I could find a reference to that issue.

There are a few numbers to be fixed. The set of quartets on Philips are not 839727, -28, -29; those numbers partly belong to a set of the Bartók quartets. A set of EMI numbers (belonging to Barbirolli's Op. 5) slipped into the LaSalle Quartet's Op. 30 on D.G. Glenn Gould's SET 2012 is a French CBS number, not Decca. Yvonne Minton's Op. 21 was belatedly released on domestic LP in 1986.

I could improve on some dates, add some issue numbers, and point out a few typos, but this is already too much nitpicking for such a fine job. The discography is remarkable complete, with recordings from even the most obscure countries, issue numbers from all over, and large percentage of recording dates. The errors and typos are minimal, and this is close to the best we can expect in composer discography. It serves both the average reader and the Schoenberg specialist well. That's the way to do it.

- J. F. Weber