
BOOK REVIEWS

Basic Musical Library, "P" Series, 1-1000.

By Larry F. Kiner and Harry Mackenzie. Foreword by Richard S. Sears. Discographies, No. 39. (Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1990).

The U.S. Government's V-Disc campaign to sustain the morale of its World War II troops with music has been well publicized and documented. The War Department's Armed Forces Radio Service, however, was significantly larger and perhaps more influential.

The Armed Forces Radio Service (AFRS) may have been the homefront's most ubiquitous audio presence to our World War II troops. By the war's end radio transmitters throughout the world were broadcasting hundreds of hours of American news, sports, and entertainment each month. Programming took many forms. Among its guises were recycled commercial radio programs (minus advertisements); AFRS-originated programs, such as *Command Performance*, *Mail Call* and *Jubilee*; shortwave broadcasts of news and sports; and locally-originating disc jockey programs.

The influence of AFRS spread far beyond bringing American culture to our armed forces. Broadcasts were heard and enjoyed by millions more than the intended audience, American troops. When this 'shadow audience' tuned in they were introduced to distinctly American programming formats and popular music. Reputedly, British listeners enjoyed the alternative to the staid BBC, and the BBC subsequently loosened up a bit after the war. Harry Mackenzie has stated that "The BBC was never the same." American broadcasting was never the same either. Bing Crosby's work on AFRS variety programs showed him the advantages of pre-recording a program—a more relaxed atmosphere where the clock need not rule and the ability to redo his songs prevailed. After the war he would demand that he be able to pre-record his own commercial music variety program, beginning the end of 'live' radio network programming.

I suspect that the informality of the American disc jockey was a particular revelation to British audiences. Each local AFRS transmitting station produced its own music programs, utilizing a subscription library of recordings provided by AFRS from stateside. These discs, called the Basic Musical Library (BML), were similar in form and content to commercial transcription libraries, such as Thesaurus or World. The music director of the BML program was Meredith Willson, later famous for his Broadway evocation of Iowa small town life and music education, *The Music Man*. BML discs were issued in several series: popular music; country and western music; classical music; religious music; and Christmas music. Recordings for the series were drawn from regular commercial disc recording sessions, commercial radio broadcasts, and special AFRS recording sessions.

Larry Kiner and Harry Mackenzie have compiled the most complete listing to date of the first 1,000 sides of the BML popular music ("P") series, the largest of the BML series, one that continues to this day. AFRS separately numbered each side of its library series discs. Each BML 16-inch vinylite, 33-rpm, standard-groove disc side carried between 10 and 14 minutes of material. Selections by different musical groups often shared the same side. Bands separating these cuts were closed, not continuous. The authors don't indicate the exact chronological range of the first 500 BML discs. My sources indicate that the series began in August 1943. Using the recording dates as a guideline, P-1000 was probably issued in early 1948. The "P" series featured a wide assortment of musicians we might now term mainstream pop. Crosby, Miller, Goodman, Shore and the likes formed the mainstay during the war. Interspersed were not only Basie, Ellington, Tatum and Kenton, but Harry Owen's Royal Hawaiians, Freddy Nagel, and Frankie Carle. Kiner and Mackenzie provide much useful information about the series. To get an idea of the scope of their work, here's a sample listing, the first:

P-1 [SSL-1 P-1]

Harry James and his Orchestra

1. HE'S MY GUY (3:17) vocal-Helen Forrest
 Take 1 from Columbia Records session; 5 June 1942, Columbia Studios, Los Angeles
 10"-78 Columbia 36614 [HCO 827]
 10"-LP Columbia C-664
2. I REMEMBER YOU (3:15) vocal-Helen Forrest
 Take 2 from Columbia Records session; 29 January 1942, Columbia Studios, New York City
 10"-78 Columbia 36158 [CO 32345]
 10"-LP Columbia C-602
3. I'VE HEARD THAT SONG BEFORE (2:58) vocal-Helen Forrest
 Take 3 from Columbia Records session; 31 July 1942, Columbia Studios, Los Angeles
 10"-78 Columbia 36668 [HCO 912]
 10"-78 Columbia 37521
 10"-LP Columbia C-691
 12"-LP Columbia CL-2630
 12"-LP Columbia CS-9430

This first BML side included three selections by Harry James. Unfortunately, AFRS labels listed each selection as a "take" and numbered these "takes" sequentially. I was well into this discography before I realized that "take" 1, 2, and 3 did not refer to separate readings of a piece or masters at a recording session, as the word "take" is used by most discographers. I would prefer that the authors had not continued to use the term, even though AFRS used it. This is a particularly significant difference in terminology here because each of the James selections on P-1 are, indeed, different takes, or masters, than the commercial issues cited below each entry. Taking advantage of the Library of Congress's collections, I compared each P-1 selection with the first 78-rpm issue listed by Kiner and Mackenzie. In each case, the two recordings differed. In one, "I Remember," the only difference noticeable without playing the two versions simultaneously and switching between them ("A/B-ing") is the use of a mute by James during his coda solo on the commercial issue. (Note, too, that the 78 is Columbia 36518, not 36158 as listed.) Other differences were not as subtle, making the comparisons most interesting. Through comparisons such as these, one hears evidence that James took his sound very

seriously and experimented during different takes. It is somewhat unfortunate that Kiner and Mackenzie did not make a greater effort to discover the exact source of some of the tracks and perhaps less of an effort to list every known reissue of a track. In the case of these James recordings, the reissue numbers are superfluous because none of the tracks were from the same master.

One cannot expect the authors to trace the source of every BML track. Surely, not every disc was even available to them. First efforts at comprehensive listings such as this one naturally raise almost as many questions as they answer. However, we would be better prepared to follow their lead if they had left a clearer path for us. Other than the discographies cited at the end of the work, it is not known what sources they consulted in compiling their work. Were AFRS documents made available to them? Where are they? Do industry files make reference to AFRS uses of material? Background documents similar to those Sears reprinted in his V-disc volume would be of special interest. How were bands and music selected? A great deal of work deserves to be done on the structure, content, and influence of government music programs of World War II. With so many people hearing the same music at the same time, War Department music on V-Discs and AFRS must have been the taste-setters of the early 1940s.

Among the nice features of the volume are complete artist and title indices (Not to be taken for granted; remember Sears' *V-Discs* includes no title index!) and some fascinating tallies of the number of various kinds of listings. Kiner and Mackenzie have added up entries to let us know that "Begin the Beguine" was the most recorded song on these 500 discs (ten appearances). Every song with greater than four entries also is listed. Most frequently recorded artists on the 1,000 sides were Bing Crosby, John Scott Trotter and Gorden Jenkins (for their accompaniment to so many popular vocalists), Tommy Dorsey, Dinah Shore, and the Pied Pipers.

Yes, V-Discs contain more hotly-collected jazz material than most AFRS discs, but I believe a major reason V-Discs might be more widely known than the programs of the AFRS is the indefatigable efforts of discographers like Dick Sears. This disparity should soon disappear. Harry Mackenzie and his collaborators are working to increase our awareness of these important recordings. For decades he has been compiling discographies of AFRS programs. I'm looking forward to his soon-to-be published *One Night Stand* and many more significant contributions to our knowledge of the Armed Forces Radio Service music machine. *Reviewed by Sam Brylawski*

Dmitri Shostakovich: A Catalogue, Bibliography, and Discography: 2nd Ed.

By Derek C. Hulme. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1991. xii, 479 pp. \$98.00.

It is a matter of some interest that this "second edition" from a publisher of undoubted prestige follows a first edition of 1982 that was published by the author (actually, by Kyle and Glen Music, located in the author's home town). That first edition was the result of a decade of research, including annual visits to the Soviet Union since 1975, and its publication resulted in the gathering of considerable new information. The author's widely publicized quest for the means to enlarge his study was undoubtedly responsible for a great deal of cooperation from those whose help is acknowledged.

In an arrangement by opus number (with over a score of "sans. Op." entries scattered through the list, identified by the author's own letter system), the catalogue identifies each composition as thoroughly as one might desire, along with a discography and a bibliography for each work. Hulme's first edition was limited rather severely to records issued in Britain and the USSR, along with such others as came to his attention and

seemed necessary to add. Following a discussion of the symphonies in *DSCH* (the English Shostakovich Society's newsletter), it now appears that the discographies of the fifteen symphonies are quite complete, allowing for a few points that need to be clarified. The author states that he has broadened his coverage of continental and New World releases (Japanese numbers are also entered extensively) without claiming that the lists are absolutely complete.

The only obvious omission among the symphonies is Takashi Asahina's 1981 version of the Fifth on Japan Victor. He has abandoned a 1973 listing of the Sixth under Kondrashin, combining the entry with his previous 1967 listing as a single recording. He now thinks that Dobrin Petkov's Balkanton release of the Ninth is coupled with the Sixth, a surprisingly generous LP for the 1950s if true (his later recording of the Sixth is listed separately). He lists Mravinsky's recording of the Twelfth on Artia MK 1580 (identified as the premiere concert performance) as distinct from all other issue numbers, which he assigns to a recording of the following year. His distribution of issue numbers between the 1972 and 1976 recordings of the Fifteenth under Mravinsky is questionable (at least, VIC 28053 is not the later one, and VIC 28147, which is the later one, is missing). He lists Milan Horvath's Jugoton recording of the First and Ninth and Piano Concerto No. 1 (with only Philips and Turnabout numbers), but slips the original Philips issue of the Ninth into his discography of the Sixth, where it forms a false entry.

While I have no definitive information about most of these discrepancies, I do question his listing of the first Mravinsky recording of the Fifth. In the first edition he listed all numbers, including the clearly prewar 78s found in *WERM*, under an issue date of 1954. He has since determined that the 78s were recorded in March 1938, but he still lists all the various issue numbers under one entry. If the later date was impossible for the 78s, the earlier date seems impossible for the LP and CD issues. Seymour Solomon assures me that the tape source of Vanguard VRS 6025 was of contemporary Soviet quality, not a transfer from 78s. The consistently dependable *Record Geijutsu* gives a recording date of 1954 for the same recording on VIC 5075. William D. Curtis, in an unpublished Mravinsky discography forwarded to me by Frank Forman, dates all these *LP and CD* issues to a live recording of a concert in Moscow on April 26, 1954. On the other hand, the ca. 1954 Soviet LP (HD 02283-84) has a "historical" prefix, though this is not inconsistent with a live recording. For the Tenth, fortunately, Hulme has entered the pirate Colosseum issue of the (originally credited to the composer, who never conducted the work, or much of anything else, in his life) under the original Mravinsky recording, where it belongs.

One must get used to the author's choice of abbreviations in the discography. He uses P for "performed," I for "issued," and G for "review in Gramophone." Given the common meaning of P dates on recent records, his choice of this letter for the recording date might have been avoided.

A line of type was misplaced on page 137, resulting in Petkov's name appearing where Berglund was intended on a Bournemouth entry. Hulme identifies Mravinsky's second recording of the Eighth with the Leningrad orchestra as coming from a London concert of 1952, hardly the year for such a foreign visit, which actually occurred at the Royal Festival Hall in 1961. He admits to being a bit casual about performance dates. A few other recording dates that need to be fixed are: First, Rodzinski, April 14, 1941, and Toscanini, March 12, 1944; Fifth, Rodzinski, February 22, 1942, and Ormandy, April 8, 1965; Sixth, Stokowski, December 8 and 22, 1940, and Reiner, May 26, 1945, and Bernstein, October 14, 1963; Seventh, Steinberg, December 1945, and Celibidache, December 21, 1946, and Bernstein, October 22-23, 1962; Ninth, Kurtz, April 8, 1947; Tenth, Ormandy, April 10 and

18, 1968; Fourteenth, Bernstein, December 8, 1976. The Eleventh under Stokowski is on two sides of Everest 3310 and Seraphim S 60228, not four.

The author may accept "obsession" as the term that best describes his affair with Shostakovich, but nothing less would have produced such a mammoth catalogue of the composer's extensive output as this. The discographies probably take up about half the space of the catalogue, so it belongs to the record collector as much as the musicologist. The composer's widow offers a Foreword. The printing and binding are worthy of the distinguished publisher. No Shostakovich devotee will want to miss this work. *Reviewed by J. F. Weber*

The Penguin Encyclopedia of Popular Music.

Edited by Donald Clarke. New York: Penguin Books, 1990. 1,378 pp. Paperback. \$19.95.

A few years ago you would have searched in vain for a good one-volume pop music reference work. Now for about \$50 you can have two excellent ones: *The Faber Companion to 20th-Century Popular Music* by Phil Hardy and Dave Laing, (reviewed in *ARSC Journal*, Volume 22, No. 1, Spring 1991) and *The Penguin Encyclopedia Of Popular Music*. Without getting into close comparisons of the two books, they do share similar virtues. They cover much more than just rock music, do justice to record labels and producers, and include obscure but worthy artists.

The Penguin Encyclopedia is blessed with an index of 91 pages which alone justifies its purchase. It also has a short but interesting appendix with addresses of small record companies, newsletters, mail order companies, and some lesser known artists. Plus, helpful advice is provided: for the African musician Youssou N'Dour, we are advised "Write in French."

Besides rock music, the *Penguin* is particularly strong on jazz, folk (especially British folk), and African pop. The latter entries were written by Ronnie Graham, author of *The Da Capo Guide to Contemporary African Music*.

Graham is not the only distinguished contributor. Clarke has also enlisted such accomplished writers as Fred Dellar, Patrick Humphries, Ken Hunt, Robin Katz, John Tobler, and Cliff White. Counting Clarke, there are 15 contributors, and the writing is uniformly good. Most entries are written in terse, telegraphic style. Many are opinionated and laced with dry humor. Clarke explains more about the contributors and how the book was put together in his charming and gracious introduction and acknowledgements.

Another distinguishing feature of this work is the inclusion of descriptions for such musical styles as bossa nova, klezmer, swing, tango, and Tex-Mex. There are longer entries for jazz, blues, country, folk, and gospel. Entries are included for "Charts," "Recorded Sound," and the "Eurovision Song Contest," which will be helpful to American readers who may only have vague recollections of this in relation to ABBA. Major and independent record companies are treated separately, so besides Columbia, RCA, WEA, EMI, and Polygram, we also have such important labels as Chess, Delmark, Sun, Vee Jay, and Charly/Affinity. A serious omission here is Rounder, which may have to do with the book's British orientation.

Like the *Faber Companion*, the *Penguin* provides birth dates when available and death dates if applicable. It is loaded with dates, especially for album releases, and it's big on personnel changes. Sometimes following this can get tiring, especially in long entries which are not broken into paragraphs.

Generally there is little to quibble about. I didn't spot any factual errors, but I did

come across a few typos, such as Timbuck 3 instead of Timbuk 3 and Sandy Denny at one point identified as Sandy Dennis. (This may have been excusable as a typo, but unfortunately it plays havoc with the index. The incorrect reference isn't included in the Denny entry in the index, but rather with the one for the actress Sandy Dennis, who is mentioned in Barbara Cook's entry.)

But again, at least there is an index, and a quick perusal of it should convince you this book is worth much more than \$19.95. *Reviewed by Bruce Rosenstein*

The Recorded Performances of Gérard Souzay: a Discography.

Compiled by Manuel Morris. Discographies, No. 41. Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1991. xix, 238 pp. \$45.00

Like all the best discographies, this work was a labor of love. Unlike many others, compiled by discographers who diligently solve the problems of discography by trial and error, this one is Manuel Morris's first published work. He devoted many years to compiling the data to be found in catalogues and periodicals, followed by visits to London, Paris, and Baarn to find primary source material and visit the national archives. All the while, he has availed himself of the help that friends and archivists willingly offered. Finally, he put everything through word processing on his computer and printed it on the latest ink-jet printer. The result is the first discography that makes full use of the technology of the nineties, and it's beautifully done.

Its success testifies to the compiler's ability to solve the problems of the genre the first time around. This is due to one of the cardinal rules: letting the material dictate the form. Morris, recognizing that Souzay recorded for quite a few labels but is best represented on three of them, decided to set out the basic discography in chronological order or by recording dates. He then provides a list of titles alphabetically by composer, listing label and number. Finally, he lists most of the material in the first section by label and number, divided into sections for Decca, EMI, Philips, and all others (including records issued from pirated sources). Two indexes put all label/number citations (including reissues) into one cross-reference list and identify all the artists who share a place on his records.

Morris's ability to manage all of this output without using a database is a measure of his mastery of the material. Sprinkled throughout the entries are informal remarks and comments that go beyond the bald lists. He has spared no effort to solve the worst reissue problems, such as the variant contents of Capitol SG 7224 (not identical to H.M.V. ALP 1709). He lists all matrix numbers, and he has pursued recording dates as far as surviving data permit. Lacking documented dates, he arbitrarily assigns as the recording date the month preceding the first release or other notice of the record. Such a date is too late to be realistic and might have yielded to a system that would avoid establishing such inaccuracies. He gives every date available, though, including catalogues, release (and deletion) reviews, and *dépot légal* at the Phonothèque National, to enable the user to form his own conclusions.

The work is remarkably free of typos. I found on p. 72 "Hymne, 75?" for "Hymne, 77?," on p. 202 "FLPB" for "FBLP," and on p. 217 "K 632a" for "K 623a." The running heads are an unusual and valuable help for a work of this kind. While the apparatus is unique to the compiler, it is explained clearly in the introduction and hardly interferes with the use of the text. The layout is elegant, although a lot of blank space at the foot of many pages could have been saved if the compiler had been willing to place a page break within an entry. Dalton Baldwin, the singer's most distinguished accompanist (who cooperated

in the compilation), contributes a Foreword. Artist discographies don't come any better than this one. *Reviewed by J. F. Weber*

The King Labels: a Discography.

By Michel Ruppli. Westport, CT, Greenwood, 1985. 2 Vols., 899 pp., indices.

Preparing a discography for a post-World War II record company can be a challenge, depending on what sort of original session records were kept, and on available sources for cross-checking, confirmation, and amplification of the company's materials. I have not had the chance to examine any part of King Records' original ledgers myself, so I can only guess what sort of state they may have been in when compiler Michel Ruppli undertook his work.

One problem which plagues post-war era discographers is that labels below the status of the old major firms like RCA and Columbia often lacked the resources to survive in the volatile marketplace after 1945. Small operations came and went with great frequency, usually leaving behind nothing but their issued pressings. Another problem is that tape mastering replaced the acetate disc as the original source of performance in the 1948-51 period, and many tapes, along with their documentation, have not survived.

King Records fared better than most such operations, largely because it remained under the control of its founder, Sydney Nathan, who managed the label until it was sold (minus its James Brown masters, which were purchased by Brown himself) to Starday Records in the late 1960s. At first, King relied on resident country artists at station WLW which, like King, was located in Cincinnati. The rationing of raw materials kept the label's activities modest from its inception in 1943 to the war's end, when Nathan added the Queen label to his catalog for blues, jump and r&b releases. Both labels were successful in the post-war era, with King sporting the likes of Grandpa Jones, Cowboy Copas, the Delmore Brothers, Wayne Raney and Hawkshaw Hawkins, and Queen with Wynonie Harris, Earl Bostic, Wings Over Jordan, Roy Milton, and Bull Moose Jackson. Nathan added to his catalog by leasing and purchasing masters produced by others, and sometimes by buying other companies outright. Whatever need there had been for separate identities disappeared in 1947, when the Queen label was dropped and its material began to be released by King.

After rock 'n' roll swamped the market in the mid-fifties, King largely abandoned its country music commitments, except for a few bluegrass groups, notably Reno & Smiley and the Stanley Brothers, and artists like Mac Curtis, Dave Dudley, and Charlie Feathers who recorded in the rockabilly vein. Few of the latter attempts were successful and Nathan's successes in the future were to be in the r&b field, most notably with James Brown in the sixties and early seventies.

Using this book can be a problem, depending on one's needs. Ruppli clearly has expended a good bit of effort in assembling what documentary materials remain and he has consulted other sources and individuals for help with black music, for which he presents many recording dates and personnel references. The country music fan, unfortunately, will not find nearly as much dependable information, primarily because it is clear that Ruppli's interests and knowledge do not lie in that direction. In the country sections, typos, mis-attributions, and other mistakes are sufficiently numerous that they make the book of only limited use as an authoritative resource. At least one Fairley Holden matrix (2783) is attributed to Cowboy Copas, and several Homer and Jethro matrices (2784-92) are listed as "Red Herron and his Orchestra." I'll resist the temptation

to make jokes about red herrings!

In at least a couple of instances, some bad guesses are made, once when "Minnie," of Mattie, Marthie and Minnie, is glossed incorrectly as the Grand Ole Opry's Minnie Pearl¹. The Brown's Ferry Four was another gospel group which normally included the Delmore Brothers and Grandpa Jones, but not always. Merle Travis, Clyde Moody, Red Foley, and others were often on the records too, but Ruppli invariably lists the singers as Jones, Travis and the Delmores, even on the August 1952 session which includes Moody, who is noted on that occasion as "leader." Tommy Magness was one of the great southeastern fiddlers of the 1930s and 1940s; by the time he made his only session under his own name in 1951, he was a veteran of the Roy Hall, Bill Monroe, and Roy Acuff bands. How sad that he's remembered here as Tommy Madness, and that the session note fails to take notice that the session put Don Reno and Red Smiley on record together for the first time.

If the country music section is sketchy and too often inaccurate, it still puts a lot of useful information in one place and serves as an incentive for someone with information and resolve to update and revise. Less work remains to be done on the remainder of Ruppli's work, where the data is more complete and accurate. *The King Labels* will serve as a useful reference for any library with 78-rpm holdings, which is bound to include a large number of King products unless they've been deliberately excluded. Since the book represents a considerable investment, private collectors should try to have a look at it before committing to purchase. *Reviewed by Dick Spottswood*

Note:

- 1 For the record, "Minnie" was Bertha Amburgey Woodruff. Mattie O'Neil and Martha Carson (the famed gospel singer) are her sisters; the trio also recorded for Capitol as the Amber Sisters.

His Master's Voice/La Voix de son Maître: The French Catalogue, A Complete Numerical Catalogue of French Gramophone Recordings Made from 1898 to 1929 in France and Elsewhere by the Gramophone Company Ltd.

Compiled by Alan Kelly, with the cooperation of the EMI Music Archive, London. Discographies, 37. New York, Westport, London: Greenwood Press, 1990. xxxvi, 679 pp. \$95.00.

The second installment in Alan Kelly's series of numerical discographies (the Italian catalogue was reviewed in *ARSC Journal*, Vol. 20, No. 1, pp. 86-89) confirms that this will be an indispensable reference for all discographers and collectors. As William R. Moran pointed out in the earlier review, this series of numerical lists is organized as The Gramophone Company set up its catalogue numbers: by language. Hence the first volume includes recordings sung in Italian, not necessarily recorded in Italy; the same is now true of music sung in the French language (not of records made in France). Company policy also explains the cutoff date of 1929 for these volumes, for in that year the catalogue numbering system was completely revamped. The compiler has credited the company archives almost as a co-author. This must have been a valuable source of information, but as Moran noted earlier, additional information not found in the archival papers must be gleaned from the labels and the recording itself. Kelly seems to have accepted the title information furnished by the record (much as the *Rigler-Deutsch Index* did), rather than making any attempt to establish any uniform format of titles.

It is beyond comprehension that Kelly fails to acknowledge another source of

information. Nowhere in either book does he mention John R. Bennett's series of 11 volumes, "Voices of the Past" (Lingfield, Surrey: The Oakwood Press) which were published between the early 1950s and 1977 (Bennett died in 1989). Bennett's Italian catalogue was finally bound as the third number in his series, but it had first appeared as several separate pamphlets. The French catalogue (which stopped at 1925, ignoring the electrical era) was his ninth number, published in 1973. That series was laid out in the same format as the new one, and there is even a bridge of sorts between the two publishers, for Bennett's last work, *Melodiya* (indexed by composer rather than number), was published by Greenwood in 1981 (reviewed in *ARSC Journal*, Vol. 13, No. 3, pp. 139-42). In each of the Oakwood volumes (some compiled by Bennett personally, the rest by colleagues), Alan Kelly is listed in the acknowledgements for contributing to the compilations. No one using the new series would ever guess that a previous attempt, however inadequate it might have been, had ever been published.

Undoubtedly the public availability of the earlier effort must have facilitated the collection of all sorts of information for the new series, notably the sort of data that can be found on the records themselves. In his introduction Kelly admits that more data of this sort remains to be gathered, and he appeals for assistance.

Since the new work is more than twice as long as the old and the page has 15 percent more lines, a comparison of the two is in order. Here is an entry in Bennett:

03174 AZEMA *Les deux grenadiers (Schumann) (01754 v)*

Here is the same item in Kelly:

LOUIS AZEMA (o)

032174 01754v 29-11-10 *Les deux grenadiers (Schumann) W 149*

No, the artist line is not the reason for doubling the number of pages, for typically, though not in this case, the name is followed by a group of records, usually made at the same time. Bennett had a list of double-sided issues at the end of his book, where W 149 will be found, although no cross-reference was supplied either way. Hence, the main addition to Kelly's entry is the date of recording where known; starting about 1908, almost every date is known, and before that a month and a year or a year alone is extrapolated from known data (much more helpful than silence). The real reason for the increased size of this book is its completeness, filling in long runs of missing numbers. Both books have artist indexes, where Azema's full name will be found (Bennett added voice type and dates where known). Kelly supplies voice types but no dates in his artist index, and his use of "(o)" for orchestra and "(p)" for piano is as far as he goes in identifying accompaniment, with rare exceptions.

Bennett left blank lines for many unidentified records. Where he had a blank block between 4-32692 and 4-32718, for example, Kelly fills in a complete run of issues. These are mostly by obscure singers but there are two songs by Panzéra. It is annoying to find an acute accent on the surname of Jean-Baptiste Faure, an error that Bennett avoided. Kelly seems to run out of steam as he comes into the later twenties, and while he used the archives at Hayes he might have found additional data at the Pathé Marconi files in Paris.

The format is quite readable, using what appears to be an electric typewriter. Running heads are highly serviceable. We can hope for a continuation of this work, for there are more Gramophone series and many more labels to be done. Future discographers will gratefully borrow his listings and dates for studies of artists and composers. The volume won an ARSC award for achievement last year. *Reviewed by J. F. Weber*