

# Letters

**T**here were two items missing from the Beecham discography (*ARSC Journal* 1993;24[1]:49-57).

1. A French orchestral collection on CD, released by EMI (midline price) only in Europe so far.
2. Goldmark's Rustic Wedding on Sony/Columbia on LP. When that mono recording will ever see the light of day is anybody's guess. In the recent release of the Prince Charles Edition of Bernstein's recordings, Sony/CBS has so far ignored Bernstein's recording of that work. And it was in stereo, too!

One other item. Butler did mention Beecham's wit. It would have been nice, had he mentioned that a book of samples of his wit and wisdom has been released as a Penguin paperback, at least in the U.K.

However, the writer should be complimented for alerting us to the performance of the *Missa Solemnis*. It could be quite a sleeper.

Finally, is there any truth to the rumor that the Beecham Trust has tapes of a Fürtwagler London Ring Cycle from the late 1930s, located in a Brooklyn warehouse? If so, are they going to release them on CD? I first heard the existence of these recordings in the *American Record Guide* when the publication reviewed the Fürtwagler Italian Ring Cycle, LP edition.

**William E. Walling**  
New York, NY

In their Mravinsky discography (*ARSC Journal* 1994;25[1]:12-44), Frank Forman and Kenzo Amoh question the identification of Mravinsky as the conductor on a Hall of Fame (HOF) LP of Shostakovich's First Violin Concerto. They note that of the two Melodiya recordings known to have been made by the record's soloist, Leonid Kogan, one was done with Kondrashin and the other with Svetlanov. The authors report that James Creighton assigns the HOF disc to Kondrashin, but they add that Paul Miller's A/B comparisons reveal the HOF, Kondrashin, and Svetlanov performances to be "all

distinct.”

Given that I purchased the HOF issue in 1968, it clearly could not hold the Kogan/Svetlanov collaboration of 1976. The 1961 date for the Kogan/Kondrashin performance may have prompted Creighton’s supposition concerning the HOF disc, but Miller’s comparisons challenge that attribution.

The contradictions in the evidence prompt me to ask whether the HOF disc might have erred in identifying the soloist rather than the conductor. That is, might the LP contain the 1956 Mravinsky collaboration with David Oistrakh? This possibility would comport with the published evidence, but Forman and Amoh do not say whether it was considered.

Incidentally, my copy of HOF 512 does not, contrary to the discography’s claim, carry any label of being a “live recording.” The recording itself, however, does contain either audience or stage noises.

**Karl E. Gwiasda**  
**Ames, IA**