

African-influenced area of Columbia. It has a strong Caribbean link, not only due to geography, but to workers from there and other parts of the West Indies who worked on the canal. And, of course, many Spanish- and English-speaking people lived there as well.

Liner notes by John Storm Roberts are informative but the contents listings are somewhat confusing. The 17 individual selections are not numbered anywhere in the text, and the list on the back of the jewel box is in a different format from the liner notes list. Most of the selections, all made on site, fade in and out, and are therefore incomplete. It is clear, however, that many of these pieces last for a long time. Unique are the recordings of the Gritos, who imitate canine howling, and the many dance rhythms, ranging from simple duple meters to complex alterations of formal quadrille patterns, together with some poly-rhythmic pieces. No song texts are given, a serious omission, and the social context of the music is rarely identified. Almost as an afterthought, a very brief snippet of some native Indian flute music played in a forest concludes the album. *Reviewed by Paul Earls*

Reviewers

Carlo Caballero is writing a dissertation on Gabriel Fauré and French musical aesthetics for his doctorate at the University of Pennsylvania. He currently resides in Cambridge, Massachusetts. His work, involving both music and literature, has appeared in *19th Century Music* and *Victorian Studies*.

Paul Earls trained as a musicologist and composer at the Eastman School of Music (Rochester, NY). He studied with Howard Hanson and Charles Warren Fox. Since 1970, he has been a fellow at the MIT Center for Advanced Visual Studies working with relationships between visual arts and music.

Gary A. Galo is Audio Engineer at the Crane School of Music, State University College at Potsdam, New York where he also teaches courses in music literature. He is a contributing Editor to *Audio Amateur* and *Speaker Builder* magazines, has reviewed books for *Notes - Quarterly Journal of the Music Library Association*, and has written for *Antique Phonograph Monthly*. He is also a contributor to *The Encyclopedia of Recorded Sound in the United States*, ed. Guy Marco.

Mark Harvey teaches music at the Massachusetts Institute of Technology and is the composer/music director for the Aardvark Jazz Orchestra.

Howard Kennett is with the Technical Services Department of the Massachusetts Institute of Technology Libraries. He has a Masters Degree in Music from the University of Oregon.

Lawrence Schulman is a freelance film and video editor, translator, and teacher who has lived in Paris the past 20 years. He recently contributed the liner notes to Robert

Parker's Judy Garland: Child of Hollywood (RPCD-321) and Judy Garland in Paris, October 28, 1960 at the Olympia (Trema 710459). He produced and presented a 5-hour profile of Garland in 1985 on France-Musique, a station of the French public radio.

Corrections and Clarifications

In my review of Leopold Stokowski's April 9, 1932 recording of Schoenberg's *Gurrelieder* (*ARSC Journal* 1994;25[1]:85-89) I referred to a surviving recording of parts of the opening night performance on April 8. After that review was written Ward Marston generously supplied me with a copy of all of the surviving material from the April 8 concert, which was recorded at 78rpm. The performance problem in Part 1, mentioned in the review, merits comment. On page 37 of the Berg piano/vocal score (Universal Edition), the time signature at Waldemar's entrance on "So tanzen die Engel" is 4/4. This is preceded by a brief passage for orchestra in 3/2. A half note in parentheses at the meter change indicates that the 4/4 section should be performed two beats to the measure, rather than four.

Stokowski must have conducted this section differently in rehearsal than in performance, and the result is, indeed, a catastrophe. Tenor Paul Althouse is in two, but the entire orchestra is in four, at half his tempo. After eight measures or so, some of the 'cellists realize what has happened, and attempt to catch up with Althouse. Unfortunately, they skip too far ahead, requiring Althouse to skip ahead to find them. He omits four measures beginning with "So lieblich..." and enters on "wie Waldemars..." But he is too late to find the 'cellists. Stokowski can be heard speaking to the orchestra (rather faintly, actually) and gradually the orchestra finds its way. By the middle of page 38 everyone is, once again, performing the same piece of music. The performance nearly came to a standstill, and I'm surprised the orchestra was able to continue without stopping.

In his liner notes, Ward Marston suggests that the performance problems were the reason Victor engineers abandoned the recording. After hearing the surviving material, I doubt that this was the case. There are only 4 minutes and 50 seconds missing from the end - otherwise Part 3 is complete. The disaster in Part 1 occurred relatively early in the work. The rest of the performance (at least what survives on the recording) proceeded without incident, and although the two subsequent performances show some improvement in technical security, there are no problems in the rest of the April 8 concert which would have caused the Victor engineers to abandon the recording.

While attending the 1994 ARSC conference in New York, Jerome F. Weber referred me to a review of the original *Gurrelieder* recordings in the July 1932 issue of *Disques* which, in turn, prompted a letter to the editor by Charles O'Connell, RCA Victor's director of artists and repertoire. On page 193 of the July '32 issue, the anonymous critic complains about the sometimes awkward side breaks in the 78rpm set, noting that the recording engineers seemed to choose the "worst possible places" to switch from one record to the next.

In his letter in the following issue, on page 273, O'Connell notes that Stokowski's tempos changed from one performance to the next. The careful notations he and the recording engineers had made in their scores became "useless" during the recording of the April 11 concert, forcing them to improvise the side breaks, rather than stick to their previously laid plans. O'Connell mentioned that the April 8 concert was also

recorded at 78rpm, and further notes that the side breaks in the April 8 recording "with one or two exceptions, were almost ideal".

Ward Marston's excellent editing on the April 8 recording makes finding side breaks difficult, but they are easily identified where sides are missing. Some of these are, indeed, in different places than the April 11 published set, but they are not always as smooth as O'Connell would have us believe. In Part 1, for example, Waldemar is cut short at the beginning of his phrase "du wunderliche Tove". The recording ends abruptly after the narrator recites "Ach, war das licht und hell!," at the bottom of page 199. At the end of this side the narrator's last note is cut short. The April 8 recording ends a full two pages earlier than side 27 of the published April 11 78s (there were 28 sides in all). A twelve inch 78rpm side could accommodate 4'50" if the dynamic range was reasonable. But, the engineers probably realized that it would be impossible to fit this much music on the last side given the forces involved for the conclusion of *Gurrelieder*. I believe this is the reason the recording was abandoned. If it is, it belies O'Connell's assertion that the side breaks went according to plan on April 8.

I am most grateful to Jerome F. Weber for mentioning the review and O'Connell's letter, and to Ward Marston for sharing the April 8 recording with me. *Gary A. Galo, Potsdam, NY*