

mer (w/Gladys Swarthout, RCAVSO, Dec. 9, 1952); *Symphony in B-flat* (SFSO, Feb. 28, 1950).

Vol. 5: Debussy: *Images* (SFSO, Apr. 3, 1951); *La mer* (BSO, July 19, 1954); *Nocturnes* (BSO, Aug. 15, 1955); *Sarabande* (orch. Ravel; SFSO, Apr. 3, 1946).

Vol. 6: Liszt: *Les préludes* (BSO, Dec. 8, 1952); **Saint-Saëns:** *Havanaise* (w/ Leonid Kogan, BSO, Jan. 12-13, 1952); **Scriabin:** *Poème d'extase* (BSO, Dec. 8, 1952).

Vol. 7: Delibes: *Coppélia* - Suite (BSO, Dec. 2-4, 1953); *Sylvia* - Suite (BSO, Dec. 30-31, 1953); **Gounod:** *Faust* - Ballet Music (SFSO, Dec. 22, 1947).

Vol. 8: Franck: *Pièce héroïque* (orch. O'Connell; SFSO, Apr. 22, 1941); *Symphony in D minor* (SFSO, Jan. 7, 1961); **D'Indy:** *Istar* - Symphonic Variations (SFSO, Jan. 27, 1945).

Vol. 9: D'Indy: *Fervaal* - Prelude (SFSO, Jan. 27, 1945); *Symphony on a French Mountain Air* (SFSO, Apr. 21, 1941); *Symphony No. 2* (SFSO, Mar. 2, 1942).

Vol. 10: Lalo: *Le roi d'ys* - Overture

(SFSO, Mar. 4, 1942); **Ravel:** *Alborada del gracioso* (SFSO, Dec. 22, 1947); *Daphnis et Chloé* - Suite No. 1 (SFSO, Apr. 3, 1946); *La Valse* (SFSO, Apr. 21, 1941); *Valse nobles et sentimentales* (SFSO, Apr. 3, 1946).

Vol. 11: Rimsky-Korsakov: *Scheherazade* (SFSO, Mar. 3-4, 1942); *Sadko* (SFSO, Mar. 3, 1945); *Symphony No. 2* (SFSO, Apr. 2, 1946).

Vol. 12: R. Strauss: *Ein Heldenleben* (SFSO, Dec. 20, 1947, previously unissued); *Tod und Verklärung* (SFSO, Jan. 23, 1960).

Vol. 13: Stravinsky: *Pétrouchka* (BSO, Jan. 28, 1959); *Le sacre du printemps* (BSO, Jan. 28, 1951).

Vol. 14: Tchaikovsky: *Symphony No. 4* (BSO, Jan. 28, 1959); *Symphony No. 5* (BSO, Jan. 8, 1958); *Symphony No. 6* (BSO, Jan. 26, 1955).

2. Monteux, Doris G. *It's All in the Music*. (New York, NY: Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 1965).
3. O'Connell, Charles. *The Other Side of the Record*, pp. 226-228. (New York, NY: Alfred A. Knopf, 1947).

Wagner: *Der Ring des Nibelungen* - The 1927-32 HMV "Potted" Ring Cycle.¹ Frida Leider, Friedrich Schorr, Göta Ljungberg, Walter Widdop, Florence Austral, Florence Easton, Lauritz Melchior, Maria Olszewska, Ivar Andréßen, et al., soloists; Symphony Orchestra, London Symphony Orchestra, Berlin State Opera Orchestra, Vienna State Opera Orchestra and the Orchestra of the Royal Opera House, Covent Garden, conducted by Albert Coates, Leo Blech, Robert Heger, Karl Alwin, John Barbirolli, Karl Muck and Lawrence Collingwood. Pearl CDS 9137 (7 CDs for the price of 5).

With its total duration of approximately fifteen hours, Wagner's *Der Ring des Nibelungen* was not a work well suited to the 78 rpm medium. The cycle was recorded in its entirety under studio conditions only after the introduction of magnetic tape. The first attempt to put a complete *Ring* on tape for commercial release began in September and October 1954, when EMI recorded *Die Walküre* uncut, with Wilhelm Furtwängler conducting the Vienna Philharmonic Orches-

tra. This was to be the first installment in a complete Furtwängler *Ring*, but the conductor's untimely death one month later, at the age of sixty-eight, prevented the project's completion.

It was not until Decca/London's pioneering work under the direction of producer John Culshaw that Wagner's *Ring* was recorded for commercial release in its entirety. Culshaw took full advantage of the capabilities of magnetic tape and stereophonic techniques, introducing the concept of the "long take". Recording sessions typically involved the recording of twelve to fifteen minutes of continuous, uninterrupted music. This was virtually unprecedented, since early 1950s sessions recorded on tape for LP release were invariably done in four to five minute segments, a holdover from the 78 rpm days. For the Decca *Ring* Culshaw assembled a superb international cast, capturing the last of the great Wagner singers, including Wolfgang Windgassen, Birgit Nilsson, and Gottlob Frick, in performances which, if present vocal trends continue, will never be equaled. Sir Georg Solti has been justly criticized for his heavy-handed approach to music, but he and the Vienna Philharmonic proved to be a synergistic combination at the time these recordings were made. His *Ring* is, without question, a high-energy reading, less profound than Furtwängler, Hans Knappertsbusch or Clemens Krauss. Yet the Vienna Philharmonic, with its legacy of *Ring* performances under this century's greatest Wagner conductors, never failed to play with line, direction and a sense of the musical architecture. Culshaw's book *Ring Resounding* and the recently released BBC film *The Golden Ring* (London VHS and Laser Disc, 440 071 253-2) offer fascinating accounts of the making of these landmark recordings. They remain one of the supreme achievements in the history of recorded sound.

Had the *Ring* been recorded in its entirety on 78 rpm discs, it would have required approximately 110 double-faced, twelve inch records! Only two acts from the *Ring* were recorded complete on 78s, both from *Die Walküre*. Act I was recorded by HMV in 1935, on eight 78 rpm discs, with Lauritz Melchior, Lotte Lehmann, Emmanuel List, and the Vienna Philharmonic conducted by Bruno Walter. In this writer's opinion, the performance deserves its reputation as the finest First Act of *Die Walküre* on record. A superb CD transfer, done by Keith Hardwick, is still available on EMI, CDH 7 61020.

In 1945 American Columbia recorded a complete Act III, also on eight discs, featuring Helen Traubel as Brünnhilde, Herbert Janssen as Wotan, with the New York Philharmonic conducted by Artur Rodzinski. This respectable, if less than spellbinding, performance last appeared on a two-LP Odyssey set, 32 26 0018, "electronically rechanneled for stereo." It deserves a true mono CD reissue from Columbia's original 33 1/3 rpm lacquer masters, since it captured Traubel in her prime, and reveals the Metropolitan Opera's mid-'40s "house" cast to be superior to what they, or any other opera company, can assemble today.

Between 1935 and 1938 HMV also recorded Act II, but even ten discs could not accommodate the act without cuts. Melchior, Lehmann and List are joined by a young Hans Hotter as Wotan, Marta Fuchs as Brünnhilde and Margarete Klose as Fricka, though Brünnhilde and Wotan are replaced by the substantially inferior Ella Flesch and Alfred Jerger during their brief appearance in Scene 5. Bruno Seidler-Winkler and the Berlin State Opera Orchestra perform scenes 1, 2 and 4, with Walter and the Vienna forces in the remainder. Despite the use of two conductors and orchestras, the performance is remarkably coherent, and contains some exceptional singing. The combined Acts I and II document Melchior's only

commercial recording of an entire Wagner role; for that alone they are truly significant.

Unfortunately, EMI's CD reissue of Act II, CDH 7 64255, is missing part of the short orchestral interlude between Scenes 3 and 4, even though it was recorded on the original 78s. This was done to fit the performance on a single CD, a poor excuse, at best. The same Keith Hardwick transfer of Act II was included complete as originally recorded on the French EMI LP collection *Les Introuvables du Chant Wagnérien*, 2902123, issued several years before Act I was transferred to CD. If EMI had planned the CD reissues more carefully, they could have combined both acts in a two disc set, eliminating the need for the senseless edit.

The Pearl collection reviewed here consists of material recorded prior to the *Walküre* sets discussed above. Between 1926 and 1932 (Pearl's title notwithstanding), HMV recorded substantial portions of the *Ring* on 78 rpm records. These recordings were made in a rather piecemeal fashion, with a variety of conductors, orchestras and singers, and issued in various forms by HMV and Victor. Although originally issued individually, most of these recordings were eventually packaged in albums as well. The 1936 edition of R. D. Darrell's *The Gramophone Shop Encyclopedia of Recorded Music* offers commentary on these recordings which has now become an invaluable guide to sorting out what is a rather tangled web.² This writer owns many of these recordings on Victor 78s, and referred to them extensively during the preparation of this review.

Victor issued the fourteen *Die Walküre* records in two albums, M-26 and M-27, which *The Gramophone Shop Encyclopedia* described as a "nearly complete recording". In reality, slightly more than half of the complete opera was included. Victor set M-60 consisted of sixteen records of music from *Götterdämmerung*, more accurately described by Darrell as "representative excerpts".

The *Das Rheingold* and *Siegfried* situations are somewhat more complex. *Das Rheingold* was the most underrepresented of the four *Ring* operas, with only twenty-two of the work's 150 minutes recorded by HMV. The five sides were never issued as a set, though the two discs containing "Spottet nur zu!," "Wotan, Gemahl," and the final scene were combined with excerpts from *Siegfried* as HMV set GM-57. Albert Coates' *Rheingold* Prelude was made with an ensemble labeled "Symphony Orchestra," a London studio group assembled specifically for the purpose of recording, and with whom Coates made dozens of records. The studio Symphony Orchestra was not identical to the London Symphony, with whom he also made numerous recordings. Coates' *Rheingold* Prelude was issued individually as Victor 9163, coupled with a concert orchestral version of Ride of the Valkyries from Act III of *Die Walküre*. *The Gramophone Shop Encyclopedia* noted that the lack of a "nearly complete" *Rheingold* was the "most serious gap in the recorded *Ring* repertory".

Victor issued HMV's initial collection of *Siegfried* excerpts on ten discs as set M-83. Lauritz Melchior and Rudolf Laubenthal shared the title role, with Frida Leider joining Laubenthal for a heavily abridged Act III duet. As HMV rerecorded Laubenthal's scenes with Melchior, adding substantially more material, Victor issued two more *Siegfried* sets, M-161 and M-167, consisting of six and four records, respectively. M-167 contained a complete Act III duet with Melchior and Florence Easton. However, these two Victor Albums did not replace the original M-83. In order to hear all of the *Siegfried* excerpts recorded by HMV, one had to purchase all three Victor albums. HMV offered an alternative to this confusion, set GM-172, a nineteen disc album in automatic sequence featuring Melchior

throughout and eliminating duplications. With nearly two-thirds of the opera featured in GM-172, *Siegfried* received the most thorough recorded treatment of the *Ring* tetralogy.

John Culshaw wrote rather disparagingly of what he called “these hotchpotch ventures”. Speaking of the extensive cuts, the frequent changes in conductors and even casting, Culshaw wondered “how anyone was supposed to get a conception of the piece from this sort of mess...”³ Fortunately, collectors can now decide for themselves if HMV’s early efforts are worth hearing, since Pearl is the first label to make all of these recordings available in a single collection. Indeed, some of these recordings were never reissued on LP, and are known only to 78 collectors. Culshaw’s comments notwithstanding, collectors owe Pearl a debt of gratitude for the reissue of these recordings, since they capture some of the most important Wagner conductors and singers heard between the two World Wars. As such, they represent performance styles, and capabilities, radically different from what contemporary listeners are accustomed.

Mark Obert-Thorn served as both producer and transfer engineer for this entire project, and his work is excellent. By 1935 Victor had modified their shellac formulation, in part by reducing the quantity of limestone filler. The new pressings were less noisy than their predecessors, and can be identified by a small “z” stamped in the run-out portion of the record. Obert-Thorn was able to use “z” pressings for most of this project, resulting in surprisingly quiet transfers. He has also captured a remarkable amount of orchestral detail and dynamic range from these recordings; as such, collectors will be grateful that Pearl, rather than Nimbus, has produced this collection. This writer has only one minor quibble with the transfers - the extreme low frequency rumble contained on some of the 78 rpm discs should have been more effectively filtered. Listeners who own loudspeakers of modest bass capabilities will not hear the rumble, but it is quite audible on this reviewer’s Audio Concepts Sapphire III/Sub-1 satellite/subwoofer loudspeaker systems, which have an in-room response extending to 22Hz.

In order to maintain a sense of continuity throughout each act Obert-Thorn has joined as many 78 rpm sides as possible, even when there are cuts between sides. In cases where there are cuts, he has left a few seconds of disc surface noise before beginning the next side. As originally recorded, the *Die Walküre* set was missing Scenes 1 and 2, save for the Prelude and Siegmund’s opening lines. Rather than isolate the first side, Obert-Thorn has joined it with side 2, which is the beginning of Scene 3, leaving an appropriate pause.

HMV did not record Act I, Scene 1 of *Götterdämmerung*, which normally follows Siegfried’s Rhine Journey. Again, Obert-Thorn has left a few seconds of disc surface noise between the conclusion of the Rhine Journey, and the first recording in Act I, “Begrüße froh, o Held”. This method of assembling the various recordings results in a much more satisfying listening experience than would be possible if each recording was isolated from the others. In *Das Rheingold* the cuts are so extensive, and the harmonic relationships so remote, that such joins would not make sense. Obert-Thorn has wisely isolated the *Rheingold* discs. He has generously indexed each CD, so listeners will have no difficulty following the sequences involving changing conductors, orchestras and casts, and returning to favorite recordings.

In some cases, Obert-Thorn has accomplished extremely difficult editing with

impressive results. HMV had recorded a complete concert version of the Dawn and Rhine Journey sequence from *Götterdämmerung* on two 78 rpm sides, with Albert Coates and Symphony Orchestra. Victor issued this as a single disc, catalog number 9007, but the record was not included in set M-60. Sides 5 and 6 of M-60 contained the entire Prologue duet with Walter Widdop and Florence Austral, with Coates conducting the London Symphony. Side 7 of M-60 duplicated Side 2 of single disc 9007 - they both bear matrix number CR137, take 1. Since the Rhine Journey actually begins midway through Side 1 of 9007, there is a gap in the music between Sides 6 and 7 of set M-60.

Obert-Thorn has solved this problem elegantly. He has used all of Victor 9007, even though it was not part of the M-60 album. Victor 9007 is taken midway through side 1, at which point Obert-Thorn edits to side 5, and then 6, of M-60. At the end of Side 6, we are taken back to the middle of side 1 of 9007 which, in turn, is joined to Side 2. The editing is seamless, accomplished with overlaps rather than razor blade splices, and results in an uncut sixteen minute sequence. Musically, this works extremely well, since Coates is the conductor throughout. Coates took an extremely rapid tempo in the Prologue Duet, but his tempo in the Rhine Journey is none too leisurely (he was never known for slow tempi), so the musical continuity is most convincing. Only a slight change in the character of the recorded sound reveals that the sequence was not originally recorded in this order. Victor 9007 was recorded in Queens Hall, London, in 1926, whereas sides 5 and 6 of M-60 were done two years later in Kingsway Hall.⁴ It would be impossible to achieve a perfect match in recorded sound under these circumstances.

Obert-Thorn has used overlaps to accomplish a number of other difficult side joins, including the Love Duet sequence in Act I of *Die Walküre*. Only one of Obert-Thorn's editing decisions may arouse some controversy. Side 6 of M-26, labeled "Love Duet - Part 2" by Victor, ends with Sieglinde's line "Siegmund, so nenn ich dich!" The word "dich" is accompanied by a B minor chord in the score, but conductor Lawrence Collingwood changed this to a D major chord to give the side a concert ending. Side 7 contains the required B minor triad, but the overlap produces a momentary dissonance when A-natural and B-natural collide. It quickly passes, however, and this reviewer cannot fault Obert-Thorn for attempting to maintain continuity through the end of the act. There is no way to avoid the concert D major chord, if Sieglinde is to sing the last word in the phrase.

One additional recording originally issued separate from the albums has also been included here, that being the Fricka/Wotan scene from Act II of *Die Walküre*, beginning at "Der alte Sturm, die alte Mühl!" This recording, issued on two 78 rpm discs as Victor 7742/3, is sung by Friedrich Schorr and Emma Leisner, with John Barbirolli conducting the London Symphony Orchestra. As Darrell noted, this pair of discs came close to filling "the serious gap between sides 8 and 9 in M-26". Obert-Thorn has exercised excellent judgment by supplementing the albums with additional material where consistency in conductors and/or casts justifies their inclusion.

As previously noted, HMV replaced the *Siegfried* excerpts recorded by Rudolf Laubenthal in M-83 with the more extensive excerpts recorded later by Melchior. Nonetheless, the Laubenthal recordings should not be dismissed, since the duet fragments from Act III are Frida Leider's only electrical recordings of this music.

Pearl has included all of the Laubenthal material, along with several other necessary items, on a supplemental CD. HMV set GM-57 contained a concert version of the Forest Murmurs from *Siegfried*, with the Berlin State Opera Orchestra conducted by Leo Blech. Sets M-83 and GM-172 contained a more complete version with Coates, the London Symphony, along with Melchior and soprano Nora Gruhn, which is featured on the CDs devoted to *Siegfried*. Blech's concert version is included with the supplemental material.

In 1927, a year after Coates recorded the Dawn, Rhine Journey and Funeral March from *Götterdämmerung*, HMV made additional recordings of the Rhine Journey alone, and Siegfried's Funeral March, with Karl Muck conducting the Berlin State Opera Orchestra. HMV included the Muck recordings in their *Götterdämmerung* album, GM-76, but Victor used the Coates recordings in set M-60 (minus the first side of the Dawn and Rhine Journey, as discussed above). These recordings are Muck's only contributions to the series, and are included with the supplementary material.

In May, 1931 Lawrance Collingwood and the London Symphony recorded 90 leitmotifs from the *Ring*, on two discs. These were never part of the complete albums, but they are included here as well. The printed music HMV included with the 78s is reproduced in Pearl's booklet, with each motive numbered. The recordings contain no verbal explanations except a terse "Number 1," "Number 77," etc. Different narrators were used during the two recording sessions, and Obert-Thorn suggests that one may be Collingwood himself. Perhaps the first session convinced Collingwood that conducting while recording the announcements was too awkward. Obert-Thorn has provided separate track numbers for each motive, giving the supplemental disc a total of 99 tracks.

Among the many singers represented in the principle roles, it is Lauritz Melchior's *Siegfried* which remains the most impressive achievement. Melchior combined his superhuman natural endowment with a polished *bel canto* vocal technique, and his recordings of *Siegfried*, *Siegmund* and *Tristan* define the term "heldentenor". Melchior was often criticized for lax attention to rhythmic and notational details, and a lack of depth in his characterizations. Live recordings made during the last ten years of his career do show a tendency toward laziness, but the HMV recordings are different matter entirely. Melchior delivers Siegfried's music with striking dramatic conviction, unparalleled energy and stamina, yet he never sacrifices beauty of tone. Listeners will find him more faithful to the printed score than in later recordings, though he still approximates some of Wagner's notation in the more athletic passages of Act I.

In Act III Melchior is joined by Florence Easton for a superb, uncut final scene. Easton was an incredibly versatile singer, with nearly 90 roles in her repertoire, encompassing such diverse vocal territory as Gounod's *Faust*, Puccini's *La Fanciulla del West* and Verdi's *Rigoletto*. She sang virtually all of the major and several minor Wagner roles, including Sieglinde, Isolde, Brünnhilde, Senta, Eva, Elsa, Kundry, Freia and the Forest Bird. It is because of her astounding diversity, and sparsity of recordings, that she is not identified with any particular composer, least of all Wagner. Though her voice did not possess the weight and sumptuous qualities of Flagstad, or the raw power of Varnay and Nilsson, her technique was notable for an ease of production lacking in Wagner sopranos today. Throughout the *Siegfried* duet she soars effortlessly through this difficult music, matching Melchior's voluminous tenor page after page. Easton delivers a

radiant high C in "O Siegfried! Leuchtender Spross!" and two equally impressive B-naturals later in the score. A bit of unsteadiness on her final high C is hardly a blemish after 25 minutes of such glorious singing.

This series is also noteworthy for capturing the superb characterizations of Friedrich Schorr in the roles of Wotan and the Wanderer. With the exception of one *Rheingold* and one *Walküre* excerpt sung by Howard Fry, Schorr is featured throughout. He was a true baritone, rather than a bass-baritone, with a technique grounded in an even legato. Though season after season of Wotans and Dutchmans would eventually take its toll on Schorr's upper register, the HMV *Ring* recordings reveal him in prime vocal form. Schorr's recordings are further strengthened by Frida Leider's electrifying performances as the *Walküre* Brünnhilde.

Walter Widdop was equally successful in the oratorios of Handel and the music dramas of Wagner. Widdop is simply one of the finest Siegmunds on record, surpassed only by Melchior and Jacques Urlus. Widdop possessed a strong, masculine instrument, whose pleasing vocal timbre was enhanced by his excellent technique. Widdop demonstrates time and time again that Wagner's music can be successfully sung even if one does not possess the superhuman resources of Melchior. Widdop is joined in the love duet from *Götterdämmerung* by Florence Austral, a native Australian (born Florence Wilson) who was Covent Garden's leading Wagner soprano from 1922 until 1940. Austral's operatic career was not an international one, but her Wagner recordings show Covent Garden's "house" standard to be a high one, indeed. Widdop and Austral are exactly what Wagner singing desperately needs today - sizable but human vocal equipment strengthened by the *bel canto* training of decades past. Swedish soprano Göta Ljungberg is Widdop's Sieglinde in Act I, Scene III of *Die Walküre*, a freely produced, strong soprano voice with a lyrical quality well suited to this role.

Rudolf Laubenthal is clearly strained by the demands of the young Siegfried, and the rerecording of this material with Melchior was a wise decision. In the fragmentary Act III duet Frida Leider clearly overshadows him, vocally and dramatically. Laubenthal is more comfortable in Act III of *Götterdämmerung*, where the tessitura is less taxing. Of the Mimes, Albert Reiss is more distinguished than Heinrich Tessmer. Today, Reiss would probably receive offers to sing the title role.

Ivar Andréson is a most menacing Hagen, particularly in the Second Act of *Götterdämmerung* when he summons his vassals. Unfortunately, the effectiveness of this recording is diminished by an incomplete orchestration. In the full score, Wagner calls for three steerhorns, one which should appear to come from Hagen, and the other two offstage, left and right. Hagen's steerhorn sounds a middle C natural which is sustained while the others sound D-flat, and then D-natural. Performed as directed, as in the Solti/Culshaw recording, the effect is hair-raising. Unfortunately, most opera orchestras do not own steerhorns, so the parts are usually given to three extra trombones. In this recording, Leo Blech and the Berlin State Opera Orchestra apparently could not assemble enough instrumentalists, so one trombonist plays the three notes in succession. The dissonances are missing, and the effect is ruined.

Throughout these recordings listeners will find one characteristic shared by all of the singers: there is not one vocal wobble to be found, even among the most insignificant cast members. Pitch problems of any kind are a rare occurrence. This alone provides a striking contrast to even the best efforts of opera houses

today, whether Bayreuth or the Metropolitan.

Karl Muck's brief appearance in the alternate versions of Siegfried's Rhine Journey and Funeral March produced authoritative performances, and make one wish that he had further involvement in the HMV *Ring* recordings. Muck had a reputation as a task-master, and a rather unpleasant one at that. During the late 1920s the Berlin State Opera Orchestra could be a scrappy ensemble, at least on recordings, but under Muck their playing is on a considerably higher level.

The bulk of the conducting in this series is shared by Albert Coates and Leo Blech. Though neither of these conductors was concerned with reading "between the notes" (neither was Karl Böhm, for that matter), their performances show a clear understanding of Wagner's long line and musical architecture. These performances are marked by a sense of direction and purpose, even in the shorter segments, and are often tremendously exciting. Robert Heger's appearance for much of *Siegfried* is one of the highlights of the collection, with some fine playing by the London Symphony. The Wagner orchestral style of this era reveals a preference for a dark, rather than brilliant, orchestral sonority. There is generous, but tasteful, use of string portamento, which has long since fallen out of favor.

The weakest orchestral performances are led by Lawrance Collingwood, an HMV producer who, like his Victor counterpart Charles O'Connell, frequently served as an in-house conductor. The *Walküre* Love Duet sequence conducted by him is lacking in the energy and direction which Coates brings to the adjacent recordings. Collingwood's only other appearance on the podium, with the exception of the leitmotiv demonstration, is the first side of the Immolation Scene from *Götterdämmerung*. This reviewer was surprised to find the performance quite exciting, similar in conception to the remaining fragments of the opera conducted by Coates. An explanation was quickly found, however. The matrix number of the Collingwood side is CR1472, take 2. The Coates discography lists an unpublished take 1 with the same number, recorded on August 24, 1927.⁵ Collingwood's performance had undoubtedly benefited from previous rehearsal by Coates.

There are a few errors in Pearl's otherwise extensive documentation. Pearl has not identified Albert Coates' studio Symphony Orchestra in the *Rheingold* Prelude and *Götterdämmerung* Dawn and Rhine Journey; the London Symphony Orchestra is credited on all recordings he conducted. Siegfried's Funeral March is not credited to Coates at all, the booklet grouping this recording with Collingwood's Immolation Scene excerpt. The orchestra in Collingwood's *Walküre* Love Duet is anonymous on the Victor 78s. Darrell confirms this, and Culshaw notes that the HMV sets were similarly labeled.⁶ Pearl credits the London Symphony on this recording. There is some confusion regarding the orchestra in many of the other Coates recordings. According to Dyment, the studio Symphony Orchestra was used for many of the *Siegfried* and some of the *Die Walküre* recordings. To add further confusion, Dyment lists the May 22, 1929 *Siegfried* ensemble as simply "Orchestra".⁷ The Victor record labels, and the Pearl booklet, identify all of the Coates *Siegfried* orchestras as the London Symphony.

HMV's "potted" *Ring* will not be the first exposure to Wagner's tetralogy for most listeners, and a collection of excerpts should not be expected to convey the glory of the whole. Yet these recordings are an invaluable artistic achievement in their own right, offering irreplaceable performances by some of the most important Wagnerians of the first half of this century. The excellent sound quality, production work, and completeness of the collection make this one of the most

significant historic reissues of 1994. Pearl has specially priced the set, offering the seven CDs for the price of five. No serious Wagner collector should be without these recordings. *Reviewed by Gary A. Galo.*

Endnotes

1. **Volume I (Supplemental material):**
90 Motives from *The Ring* (May 1931, LSO, Collingwood); *Siegfried: Act I:* Nothung! Nothung!; **Act II:** Das der mein Vater nicht ist (Aug. 1927); Forest Murmers (1928); Heis ward mir (Aug. 1927); **Act III:** Heil dir, Sonne!; Ewig war ich; O Siegfried! Dein war ich von je (Aug. 27, 1927, Frida Leider, sop., Rudolf Laubenthal, ten., BSOO, Blech); *Götterdämmerung: Prologue:* Siegfried's Rhine Journey; **Act III:** Siegfried's Funeral Music (Dec. 10, 1927, BSOO, Muck)

Volume II: *Das Rheingold:* Prelude (Feb. 2, 1926, SO, Coates; Spottet nur zu! (Jan. 5, 1928, Louise Trenton, sop., Elsie Suddaby, sop., Nellie Walker, con., Arthur Fear, bass, LSO, Coates); Wotan, Gemahl (Jan. 5, 1928, Walker, sop., Walter Widdop, ten., Kennedy MacKenna, ten., Howard Fry, bar., Fear, bass, LSO, Coates); Zur Burg führt die Brücke... Abendlich strahlt (June 17, 1927, Friedrich Schorr, bar., Waldemar Henke, ten., Genia Guszalewicz, con., BSOO, Blech); *Die Walküre: Act I:* Prelude...Wes herd dies auch sie (Aug. 26, 1927); Ein Schwert verhiess mir der Vater (Aug. 23, 1927); Schläfst du, Gast?...Der Männer Sippe (Aug. 27, 1927); Dich selige Frau...Winterstürme wichen dem Wonnemond (Aug. 23, 1927); *Du bist der Lenz (Aug. 16, 1926); Siegmund heiss ich (Aug. 23, 1927, Widdop, ten., Göta Ljungberg, sop., LSO, Coates and *Collingwood); **Act II:** Nun zäume dien Ross...Hojotoho! (Sept. 12, 1927); *Der alte Sturm, die alte Müh!; *So ist denn aus mit den ewigen Göttern; *Was verlangst du? (Apr. 1932); O heilige Schmach!; So nimm meinen Segen (Sept. 12, 1927, Leider, sop.,

Emmi Leisner, m-sop., Schorr, bar., BSOO, Blech and *LSO, Barbirolli); Raste nur heir...Hinweg! Hinweg! (May 27, 1927); Siegmund, sich auf mich! (Aug. 23, 1927); Fänd'ich in Walhall..So jung und schön (Aug. 26, 1927); *Zauberfest bezähmt ein Schlaf (Oct. 25, 1927); Wehwalt! Wehwalt!..Geh hin, Knecht! (Aug. 23, 1927, Widdop, ten., Ljungberg, sop., Florence Austral, sop., *Trenton, sop., Fry, bar., LSO, Coates); **Act III:** Ride of the Valkyries (Oct. 1927); Rette mich, Kühne! (Nov. 1, 1927); Wo is Brünnhild (Oct. 1927); War es so schmähhlich (Nov. 1, 1927); Du zeugtest ein edies Geschlecht (Sept. 29, 1927); Leb wohl, du kühnes...Der Augen leuchtendes Paar...Loge, hör! (June 17, 1927, Leider, sop., Schorr, bar., Ljungberg, sop., BSOO, Blech)

Volume III: *Siegfried: Act I:* Prelude...Zwangvolle Plage!... Hoiho! Hoiho! Hau ein!...Als zullendes Kind zog ich dich auf...Soll ich der Kunde glauben...Aus dem Wald fort...Heil dir, weiser Schmied...Dein Haupt pfänd ich (May 1931, Lauritz Melchior, ten., Heinrich Tessmer, ten., Schorr, bar., LSO, Heger); Fühltest du nie im finstren Wald... Nothung! Nothung! Neidliches Schwert!...Hoho! Hoho! Hahei!...Schmiede, mein Hammer (May, 1929, Melchior, ten., Albert Reiss, ten., LSO, Coates); **Act II:** In Wald und Nacht...Zur Neidhöhle fuhr bei Nacht...Deine Hand hieltest du vom Hort? (May 21, 1931, Eduard Habich, bar., Schorr, bar., LSO, Heger); Das der mein Vater nicht ist...Du Holdes Voglein! (May 17, 1929, Melchior, ten., LSO, Coates); Haha! Da hätte mein Lied...Wohin schleichts du eilig und schlau (May 21, 1931, Melchior, ten.,

Tessmer, ten., Habich, bar., LSO, Heger); Da lieg auch du, dunkler Wurm!...Gönntest du mir wohl ein gut Gesell?...Hei! Siegfried erschlug nun den schlimmen Zwerg! (May 22 & 17, 1929, Melchior, ten., Nora Gruhn, sop., LSO, Coates); **Act III: Prelude...Wache, Wala...Stark ruft das Lied...Dir Unweisen ruf ich ins Ohr** (1928, Emil Schipper, bar., VSOO, Alwin); Kennstest du mich, kühner Spross...Zich hin!...Siegfried mounts the rocky height (May 22, 1929, Melchior, ten., Rudolf Bockelmann, bar., LSO, Coates); Selige Öde auf sonniger Höh'!...Das ist kein Mann! (May 12, 1930, Melchior, ten., LSO, Heger); Heil dir, Sonne!...O Siegfried! Siegfried!...Ewig war ich...Dich lieb ich...Ob jetzt ich dein? (May 29, 1932, Florence Easton, sop., Melchior, ten., OROHCG, Heger)

Volume IV: Götterdämmerung:

Prologue: Welch Licht leuchtet dort? (Oct. 17, 1928 & Jan. 3, 1929, Noel Eadie, sop., Evelyn Arden, sop., Gladys Palmer, con., LSO, Coates); Dawn...Zu neuen Taten...Siegfried's Rhine Journey (Jan. 26, 1926 and Oct. 18, 1928, Austral, sop., Widdop, ten., SO and LSO, Coates); **Act I: Begrüßefroh, o Held** (Oct. 10, 1928, Fear, bar., Widdop, ten., Frederic Collier, bass, Ljungberg, sop., LSO, Coates); Hier sitz ich zur Wacht (Feb. 17, 1928, Ivar Andréson, bass, BSOO, Blech); Seit er von dir geschieden (Aug. 23 & Oct. 25, 1927, Feb. 16, 1928, Maartje Offers, con., Austral, sop., LSO, Coates); **Act II: Hoiho! Hoihohoho!** (June

21, 1928, BSOO & Chorus, Blech); Helle wehr! (Oct. 17, 1928, Widdop, ten., Austral, sop., LSO, Coates); Welches Unholds List (Oct. 18, 1928, Austral, sop., Collier, bass, Fear, bar., LSO, Coates); **Act III: Frau Sonne sendet lichte Strahlen** (Sept. 1928, Laubenthal, ten., Tilly De Garmo, sop., Lydia Kindermann, sop., Elfriede Marherr, con., BSOO, Blech); Mime heiss ein mürrischer Zwerg...Brünnhilde, heilige Braut! (Sept. 1928, Laubenthal, ten., Desider Zador, bar., Emmanuel List, bass, BSOO & Chorus, Blech); Siegfried's Funeral Music (Jan. 26 and Mar. 26, 1926, LSO, Coates); Schweight eures Jammers...Starke Scheite schichtet mir dort (1927, Austral, sop., LSO, Collingwood); Sein ross führet daher...Finale (Aug. 25 & 26, 1927, Oct. 25, 1927, Austral, sop., LSO, Coates)

2. Darrell, R.D. *The Gramophone Shop Encyclopedia of Recorded Music*. (New York, NY: The Gramophone Shop, 1936).
3. Culshaw, John. *Ring Resounding*, Pp. 7-8. (New York, NY: Viking Press, 1967).
4. Dymont, Christopher. "Albert Coates Discography" in *Recorded Sound*, Nos. 57 and 58, January and April 1975.
5. Dymont.
6. Darrell and Culshaw.
7. Dymont.

Bellini: La Sonnambula. Joan Sutherland (Amina); Eileen di Tullio (Lisa); Betty Allen (Teresa); Renato Cioni (Elvino); Armand McLane (Alessio); Leo Goeke (Notary); Ezio Flagello (Rodolfo); American Opera Society Chorus & Orchestra; conducted by Nicola Rescigno.

Bellini: I Puritani. Excerpts. Joan Sutherland (Elvira); Nicola Filacurdi (Arturo); Ernest Blanc (Riccardo); Giuseppe Modesti (Giorgio); Edinburgh Festival; conducted by Vittorio Gui. Standing Room Only SRO 841-2 (2 CDs) distributed by Lyric.