

**Judy Garland: The Golden Years at M-G-M - The Harvey Girls, The Pirate, Summer Stock.** MGM/UA Home Video. ML104869. 5 laser discs, 2 sides in CAV. 7 hours of prerecordings on analog track; stereo in part; NTSC. Released in 1995.

**Thoroughbreds Don't Cry and Listen, Darling.** MGM/UA Home Video. ML104569. 2 laser discs. 21 minutes of prerecordings for *Listen, Darling* on analog track; NTSC. Released in 1994.

**The Ultimate Oz.** MGM/UA Home Video and Turner. ML103990. Includes *The Wizard of Oz*, ML104755, 2 laser discs, 4 sides in CAV, THX and No-Noise; and *The Wonderful Wizard of Oz: The Making of a Movie Classic*, ML104756, 1 laser disc, THX. 4 hours 48 minutes of prerecordings on analog and digital tracks; NTSC. Released in 1993.

**The Wizard of Oz: Original Motion Picture Soundtrack.** Rhino Movie Music/Turner Classic Movies R2 71964. 2 compact discs. Released in 1995.

**Meet Me In St. Louis: 50th Anniversary Edition.** MGM/UA Home Video and Turner. ML104754. 3 laser discs and 1 compact disc of soundtrack (CD: MGM Records 305123). 4 sides in CAV; remixed from original multi-channel recording masters into stereo; 52 minutes of prerecordings on analog track; Includes *The Making of an American Classic*; NTSC. Released in 1994. CD also available separately on Rhino Movie Music/Turner Classic Movies R2 71958. Stereo. Released in 1995.

**Easter Parade: Original Motion Picture Soundtrack.** Rhino Movie Music/Turner Classic Movies R2 71960. 1 compact disc. Released in 1995.

**That's Entertainment! III: Deluxe Collector's Edition.** MGM/UA Home Video. ML103059. 4 laser discs, 5 sides in CAV. Contains cut filmed out takes and musical prerecordings not on release print; stereo in part; NTSC. Released in 1994. Theatrical release edition available on MGM/UA Home Video. ML103028. 1 laser disc. CD available separately on Angel/MGM Records CDQ 5 55215 2 1. Released in 1994.

*"Not all of MGM's prerecordings survive, but - either carefully or luckily - much of Judy Garland's work has been preserved".*

(John Fricke in the liner notes from **Judy Garland: The Golden Years at M-G-M**)

Whether so many of Judy Garland's prerecordings for the films in which she performed at Metro-Goldwyn-Mayer between 1936 and 1950 have survived through diligence or through luck is, in any case, a measure of the professionalism of the studio's music department and the obvious esteem its members held for the singer. In 1950, the year of her dismissal from the company (and even less so in the 1930s and 1940s), Garland was not the legendary figure we see and hear her as today. MGM's professionalism continues close to 60 years after the earliest of Garland's films with the release of all of her MGM work in laser disc format. Even better, the producers of these single or multi-disc sets - George Feltenstein, Allan Fisch and John Fricke - have not been content to merely issue quality transfers of the theatrical release versions of

these films. They have undertaken to retrieve both picture and sound elements that had been cut from the prints during editing and stored in the vaults over the decades. When one recalls how much material has been lost or poorly preserved since the birth of the motion picture exactly one hundred years ago, it is all the more astounding that MGM not only preserved its library of films, but also the original sound recordings that were subsequently mixed onto the optical track. A large number of these were recorded in multi-channel, usually two or three. Many of these individual microphone channels, recorded onto optical film, have also been preserved, enabling the company to today make veritable stereo remixes of what had previously been issued in mono.

"Stereophony" had first been demonstrated at the Paris Electrical Exhibition in 1881 by the Frenchman Clément Adler, with the first stereophonic record made by Pathé in France around 1910. It was not until 1931 that Alan Blumlein of EMI received the first patent for stereo, and 1936 that the Russians Wysotsky and Konopley developed a 2-channel 35 mm optical stereo system.<sup>1</sup> The earliest Garland prerecordings to have been remixed into stereo from individual optical channels, "In-Between" and "Meet The Beat Of My Heart", were recorded on June 24, 1938 for the film *Love Finds Andy Hardy* (1938). These are not necessarily the first multi-channel recordings to have been made at the studio, but they are the earliest ones to have survived to date. A number of other items have not survived. Though *The Wizard of Oz* (1939) was recorded starting in early October 1938, the only multi-channel recording MGM has found and remixed into stereo is Ray Bolger's "If I Only Had A Brain". For several other Garland films, among them *Andy Hardy Meets Debutante* (1940), *Life Begins For Andy Hardy* (1941) and *Presenting Lily Mars* (1943), only certain titles exist in stereo. On the other hand, *For Me and My Gal* (1942), *Meet Me In St. Louis* (1944) (except for one song tag) and *Ziegfeld Follies* (1946) are works for which the complete musical tracks can now be remixed into stereo. All in all, it is a miracle that so much has survived, enough to require us to tip our hats to the men and women at MGM, known and unknown, who over the years made a credo of conservation and preservation.

Two-and-a-half-years in preparation and several months delayed, the issuance of *Judy Garland: The Golden Years at M-G-M* in February 1995 is more than an act of hagiography. It is an event of the first order that will allow admirers of the singer and actress to finally have access to a mountain of never-before heard or seen material. At the same time, interested though less knowledgeable listeners are supplied a textbook by which they may discover an artist whose reputation today has been preserved as much by sad stories as raw talent. The set allows us to witness the incredible growth of Garland as an artist over the years, beginning even earlier than her first Metro short, *Every Sunday*, shot in 1936, and her first feature film there, *Broadway Melody of 1938*, done in 1937.<sup>2</sup> Garland shot four shorts in 1929, one for the Tec-Art Studio in Hollywood entitled *The Big Review* and three for First National (Vitaphone) entitled *A Holiday in Storyland*, *The Wedding of Jack and Jill*, and *Bubbles*, filmed in that order. The Tec-Art short, filmed on June 11, 12 and 13, 1929, and optically recorded by R-C-A Photophone, has long been in MGM's archives. The new laser disc box is the first commercial release of the film in its entirety. Garland, then still Frances Gumm or "Baby" Gumm, performs "That's The Good Old Sunny South" with her two older sisters, Susie and Jimmie, with a great sense of rhythm. Her strong voice can be heard over those of her sisters. Even today, we look at her rather than her sisters not because we know she is the future Judy Garland, but because her talent, drive and assuredness had already set her apart at the age of six.

Yet, her “Yeah, sir” shout in the highly melodious Yellen and Agar tune is not a good basis for judgment; the Vitaphone shorts, all filmed in the autumn and early winter of 1929, feature her more prominently.

It should be remembered that the Vitaphone process of recording onto a 16 inch disc rotating at 33-1/3 revolutions per minute meant performers were recorded live and filmed with several cameras at the same time. This gave the editor a choice of shots.<sup>3,4</sup> In these Vitaphone shorts, then, we are seeing the young Frances Gumm sing and dance as she must have appeared on the vaudeville stage during the 1920s. Though the discs for the Garland Vitaphone shorts had been known to exist in collectors’ circles, the film elements for them were considered lost until The Library of Congress found a soundless *Bubbles* during the preparation of the laser disc set. This explains the delay in its release. In the short, here seen integrally for the first time in sixty-six years, The Gumm Sisters sing “The Land Of Let’s Pretend”.<sup>5</sup> Except for this one brief number in which the three are dressed in Dali-esque costumes, “Baby” Gumm has no solo and the sisters are no more than background figures in the rest of the 7 1/2 minute film. As such, this short is the least interesting of the three Vitaphones. Young Frances was not deprived of solo numbers in the two earlier Vitaphones, however, and these two recordings, for which the film elements are not today extant, are included on the analog track of the set.<sup>6</sup> What is fascinating about both of the tunes in the first two Vitaphones is how the lyrics, although suited for a child, deal with themes the adult Judy Garland would touch on many years later. Her solo “Blue Butterfly”, a Jerome and Berg number from *A Holiday In Storyland*, is telling:

Blue butterfly  
 Why not be cheery  
 Though you are weary now  
 Blue butterfly  
 Start your life flying  
 Or it will bring you down  
 Cheer up  
 The meadowlark sings  
 You still have beautiful wings  
 To fly with  
 Why can’t you try  
 Be happy  
 Blue butterfly.

Frances Gumm/Judy Garland was seven years old when she sang these words. Her emphasis on the word “try” is the most disconcerting, for she would be trying to be happy for the rest of her life. To “get happy” would, in fact, be a recurrent theme in her repertoire, not only as heard in “Get Happy” two decades later, but in “When You’re Smiling” (“Come on get happy, keep on smiling”...) from the 1950s and early 1960s. Though she sings of a blue, weary butterfly here, the idea of “happy, little blue-birds” flying beyond the rainbow is only a flutter away. In her second Vitaphone, *The Wedding of Jack and Jill*, shot some nine years before *The Wizard of Oz*, her solo “Hang On To The Rainbow” predates and prefigures “Over The Rainbow” by as many years. Returning to “The Land of Let’s Pretend”, which also contains a reference to “rainbow’s ends” in the last chorus, Frances’ 10-second refrain (and close-up):

We'll weave a life of dreams  
 With threads from bright blue beams ...

is an eerie, premonitory forewarning of her future. In all, these first appearances by the young Judy Garland on screen are an invaluable glimpse of a child prodigy, displaying all the signs of talent of the artist to be, and all the seeds of trouble of the adult to become.

The incredible power of the young Judy Garland's voice is somewhat forgotten today. An excellent example of its strength can be heard on the Arthur Freed/Nacio Herb Brown song "Sun Showers". Intended for use at first in the film *Broadway Melody of 1938*, then prerecorded for *Thoroughbreds Don't Cry* (1937) but not used, it is commercially released for the first time on the analog track of the *Thoroughbreds Don't Cry* and *Listen, Darling* (1938) double set. Recorded by Garland on September 11, 1937, it postdates the recording sessions for *Every Sunday* and *Broadway Melody of 1938*. It is nonetheless one of Garland's most moving early recordings for the depth and maturity of her interpretation. The ballad, similar in theme to "Singin' In The Rain" by the same composer and lyricist, displays Judy's incredible mixture of optimism and pessimism, darkness and light, strength and weakness. She draws us into her interpretation not only by the emotional tint she gives to the words, but by her generous, flexible voice, totally under the control of the artist, only fifteen at the time. There is something already disturbing here, bordering on melancholy, but there is also hope. Still, at song's end we are left with an impression that sadness prevails over optimism. This astounding feat of subtlety is heightened by a technically startling sophistication in the use of her voice - the reduction in volume of her voice while maintaining a vibrato on the last word of the song ("here") is absolutely remarkable for an untrained voice.<sup>7</sup>

The issuing of the Garland recording sessions at MGM enables us to hear not only songs that were deleted from the released prints or cut in part (usually due to time or continuity constraints), but to witness the different takes that were spliced together to form the final version. The breakdown of "Everybody Sing" from *Broadway Melody of 1938*, wherein four partial takes were required, demonstrates the greater flexibility of recording on optical film compared to recording on wax. We learn, too, in *The Ultimate Oz* set, that the "Over The Rainbow" heard in *The Wizard of Oz* is, in fact, a combination of takes 5 (incomplete) and 6 (complete), both recorded on October 7, 1938 and both given here in their pre-edited form. That same day two other complete alternates of the same song were recorded, takes 7 and 8, albeit both taken a little faster than the final version. These are also included in *The Ultimate Oz*. We also hear the three disassembled parts that make up Judy's other main number from *Oz*, "The Jitterbug", which was eventually deleted from the final print. Her MGM interpretation of the song is interesting in that she does some marvelously expressive singing in comparison to the Decca version, which is more restrained due to the time limitations of a 78 rpm side.

*The Golden Years* and *Thoroughbreds Don't Cry/Listen, Darling* sets include other alternates, deleted songs or takes using material that didn't make it to the release print. Not only are we treated to two complete takes of "Zing! Went The Strings Of My Heart", one a swing version alternate and the other the complete ballad version used for the soundtrack, but also the two versions recorded for *Listen, Darling* in September 1938, here heard in remixed stereo for the first time. "On The Bumpy Road To Love", the other number from the same film, is also offered in two takes, one issued and the other an alternate, both in stereo. The list of unissued alternates contained in *The Golden Years* is staggering; to name a few, "Everybody Sing"

and "(Dear Mr. Gable) You Made Me Love You" from *Broadway Melody of 1938*, "Got A Pair Of New Shoes" from *Thoroughbreds Don't Cry*, "Swing, Mr. Mendelssohn" and "Melody Farm" from *Everybody Sing* (1938), "Danny Boy" from *Little Nellie Kelly* (1940), "I'm Always Chasing Rainbows" from *Ziegfeld Girl* (1941), and "Easy To Love" from *Life Begins For Andy Hardy*. Many of these alternates have also been remixed into stereo, as have the deleted tunes unheard until now, among them "Your Broadway and My Broadway" and "Yours and Mine" from *Broadway Melody of 1938*, "All I Do Is Dream Of You" from *Andy Hardy Meets Debutante*, the complete "We Must Have Music" originally recorded for *Ziegfeld Girl*, "Easy To Love", and "Smiles" from *For Me and My Gal*. Thus, the deleted "Easy To Love" is given with an alternate, and both have been remixed into stereo. Such is the wealth of material and effort put into the production of *The Golden Years*.

The double CD of *The Wizard of Oz*, issued in July of 1995, contains much music film viewers will not recognize. Presented in the order originally planned, the musical material heard is drawn from the prerecordings. It therefore includes numerous extended versions of songs and orchestral scorings slimmed down at release, as well as out takes cut from the film. Whereas the laser disc box provides individual takes which are sometimes incomplete, the compact disc supplies the musical numbers whole. This is the first time the complete score, composed by Harold Arlen, E.Y. Harburg and Herbert Stothart, has been issued since the film's release fifty-six years ago. Listening to Stothart's Oscar winning underscoring reminds us of how extensively "Over The Rainbow" was used throughout, as a leitmotif. Had it been cut from the film, as almost happened before Arthur Freed insisted it stay, the practical difficulty of eliminating the melody from the film's underscoring would have been enormous. The often repeated reason for dropping the now-classic standard from the film - that it slowed the picture down - was surely counterbalanced by this more practical consideration. Garland reprised the song in the sequence where she is imprisoned in the witch's castle. This reprise, eventually cut from the film, was recorded live on the set with Roger Edens at the piano and filmed by director Richard Thorpe. It was later re-recorded and re-filmed when director Victor Fleming took over the picture. Neither the film nor vocal elements of the Fleming version survive, but the Thorpe/Edens sound recording does. What the CD's producers have done is to conform this recording to the orchestration of the Fleming version to give the listener the possibility of hearing how the reprise would have sounded.

What would become the Garland signature tune can also be heard in the supplemental material at the end of the second CD in the form of an incomplete take 5 and the complete alternate take 7. Both are also included in *The Ultimate Oz*. The complete alternate take 8, found on the laser disc, is not on the CD. Interestingly, the superlative brochure accompanying the box contains a photocopy of the page of the conductor's log of prerecordings in which it is noted that six complete takes of "Over The Rainbow" were recorded - takes 1, 2, 4, 6, 7 and 8. We may therefore conclude that three complete alternates (takes 1, 2 and 4) have not survived. Just why certain recordings survive and others do not would have been a fascinating subject to explore in the liner notes. The supplemental material also includes demonstration records of the "Munchkinland Musical Sequence" and "Optimistic Voices", sung and played by Edens, Harburg and Arlen. Arlen was a singer before becoming a composer; his interpretations of his compositions are always enlightening and merit a CD reissue.

All of the multi-channel elements for *Meet Me In St. Louis* have survived and the new LD box presents the entire film in stereo for the first time ever. Also included

is a compact disc of the stereo soundtrack, making listening to the wonderful Hugh Martin/Ralph Blane score a richer experience. The classic Vincente Minnelli film, perhaps the greatest of the MGM musicals and certainly one of Garland's most moving roles, is now over 50 years old. MGM/UA and Turner have honored the occasion by releasing a sumptuous video transfer of the film based on the studio's original 35 mm nitrate Technicolor negatives and multi-channel music masters. Whereas the CD presents the complete soundtrack, the analog track of the laser disc provides the complete, surviving recording sessions, held between November 1943 and May 1944. The CD, rather than the laser disc, lists the exact recording dates, and includes several alternates and one out take.

The first Garland title to be prerecorded, the lovely Rogers and Hammerstein tune "Boys and Girls Like You and Me", was filmed by Minnelli but dropped before release. This sequence, along with "The Jitterbug" from *The Wizard of Oz*, is one of the important filmed Garland numbers today considered lost or destroyed. The musical recording, though, has survived and is furnished here. Even more interesting are the alternates of "Have Yourself A Merry Little Christmas", "Under The Bamboo Tree" and "The Boy Next Door", although the alternates are not as clearly noted as in *The Golden Years* set. This makes identification of the last of the three a question of close listening. The two takes of "Have Yourself A Merry Little Christmas" are not the same as the version retained for inclusion on the released optical track. An alternate of another fine tune by Nacio Herb Brown and Arthur Freed, "You and I", sung by Freed himself though lip-synched in the movie by Leon Ames, reminds us of just how much the film's score epitomizes the MGM system of values.

Another song, "The Trolley Song", reminds us of the brilliance of the Martin/Blane compositions, should we care to scratch the surface:

With my high starched collar  
 And my high-top shoes  
 And my hair piled high upon my head ...

goes the verse opening. The repetitive use of the "h" and "i" sounds is an aural mirror of not only the clang, clang, clanging of the trolley, but the thumping of a heart. After the word "hair" one might think we are through with the word "high", but we are not. The "i" of "high" is re-employed in "piled", giving us two consecutive "i" words. "Head" supplies us a new "ea" sound following the recurrent "h" sound, which the ear doesn't expect, thus making an elegant conclusion to the conjunctive. Further, the repetition of the word "high" underlines that Garland is "high" from excitement upon seeing that the boy next door has made it to the trolley. Musically, the third "high" is the highest note of the three, taking us higher and higher. The repetition of the sound "i" calls attention to the fact that she is wrapped up in herself ("I"). The clarity of Garland's diction contributes measurably to rendering the song accessible on whatever level one may choose.<sup>8</sup> In short, this is a superb score rediscovered on a superb stereo reissue.

Another fine score was written by Johnny Mercer and Harry Warren for the 1946 film *The Harvey Girls*. So abundant were their efforts that three compositions, "Hayride", "My Intuition" and "March of the Doagies", were all cut from the final print. All three resurface in *The Golden Years*. "Hayride", a rollicky melody so natural it may well have existed before its composers plucked it from the tree of their imagination, is given a musical rendition by Ray Bolger as bouncy as his dancing. Whereas the Bolger solo was never filmed, the two Garland songs were. These are

"March of the Doagies", a night sequence involving hundreds of extras, and "My Intuition", a duet with John Hodiak for which the unmatched color quality of several of the shots suggests that not all the negatives of the sequence survive. Both merit viewing. Except for "It's A Great Big World", all of *The Harvey Girls* survives in multi-channel. "It's A Great Big World" was transferred to the analog track from a mono playback disc, to which the actors lip-synched during filming.

The producers have not reissued an entire film in stereo unless every title survived in multi-channel, thus this mono transfer of the movie. The recording sessions, however, have been remixed into stereo, minus one song. Still, in "The Judy Garland Stereo Scrapbook", which closes the nine-side laser disc set, we are treated to a half-dozen filmed sequences from various pictures for which the entire movie cannot be remixed into stereo. These include "On The Atchison, Topeka, and the Santa Fe", which would surely be even more spectacular on a movie screen than it is on television.

All the surviving prerecordings for Cole Porter's *The Pirate*, provided in *The Golden Years*, are in stereo. Why, then, hasn't the optical track of the remastered film also been put into stereo? The answer may lie in the fact that what survives is not necessarily all that was prerecorded. For example, Judy's deleted version of "Love Of My Life" is found on the analog recording sessions, but the interpretation retained for the film is not. No longer possessing the multi-channel master for all the songs, the producers are again forced to leave the optical track in mono. We are, nonetheless, allowed to hear for the first time both the final and deleted versions of "Mack The Black", portions of which now only exist on disc, as well as see the stereo number, in the "Stereo Scrapbook". The song also seems to have posed either directional or interpretive problems, as witnessed by the fact that the deleted versions were recorded on December 28, 1946, while the one retained is from December 15, 1947. Multiple takes are given for "Nina", and breakdowns on "Be A Clown" and "Voodoo" are also included. The latter is the one Garland number cut.

As an extra bonus, the producers include the demo recordings done by Garland mentor Roger Edens, including one title, "Manuela", which was deleted from the shooting script. As far as Judy's singing in this film is concerned, poorly received at the time of its release but considerably re-evaluated in film circles since then, she displays a certain nervous tension in her voice which belies the surface merrymaking.<sup>9</sup> This was her first film after the birth of daughter Liza Minnelli; she too must have sensed that this was more a Minnelli movie than a Garland one. Worse yet, the picture touches on sexual and psychoanalytical issues that could only have been awkward for the fragile star to exhibit on screen, and before her husband/director. It is in this film that we see an underweight, medicated and visibly shaking (look at her close-up in "Mack The Black") Judy Garland for the first time on screen. It also marks the beginning of the end of her marriage to Vincente Minnelli, as well as her stay at Metro.

MGM/UA reissued *Easter Parade* (1948) in laser disc format in 1992 minus the recording sessions, including "Mr. Monotony", the unused musical sequence Judy filmed in the famous half-tuxedo and fedora that she would finally get to wear in *Summer Stock*. The compact disc of the Irving Berlin musical employs the best sources currently available in MGM's archives, including playback discs, parts of the original 1948 soundtrack album, and a 1/4 inch magnetic tape "comp" master (a compilation of separately recorded orchestra and vocal performances). In only one case, "I Want To Go Back To Michigan (Down On The Farm)", is the film's optical track used, since no other master source could be found. Besides "Mr. Monotony", the CD contains two unfamiliar Garland items that were trimmed down for the release print. One is a

“premiere extended version” of “Better Luck Next Time” with Clinton Sundberg providing a spoken introduction. The other is a complete “Vaudeville Montage” where for the first time we hear the original, uncut medley of “I Love A Piano”, “Snookey Ookums”, “The Ragtime Violin” and “When The Midnight Choo-Choo Leaves For Alabam”, from what appears to be a playback disc source. The medley is much more exciting musically in its complete form. Less exciting is the sound quality of the classic “A Couple Of Swells” with Fred Astaire. It sounds muffled in comparison to the soundtrack or previous CD issues, which are a far more pleasurable listening experience. This faded sound is no doubt due to the fact that magnetic tape was coming into use in the late 1940s. Magnetic tape may also explain why all these titles are in mono when we have MGM prerecordings in multi-channel dating from the 1930s. Optical film cannot be reused, but magnetic tape can. It is possible that multi-channel tapes were recycled or jettisoned, although MGM’s preoccupation with conserving its music library would seem to preclude such pettiness. Whatever the case, the producers’ efforts to locate source material must be lauded, as should their precision in giving exact recording dates for all the titles.

The Deluxe Collector’s Edition of *That’s Entertainment! III* (1994) is noteworthy in that the film as seen on theater screens has been extended in this “Director’s Cut” to include five additional musical numbers. What’s more, ten other filmed numbers have been included in “The Collector’s Treasury” as a supplement following the end of the feature. In all, the box set allows us to view six deleted Garland numbers. While “Mr. Monotony”, the excised sequence from *Easter Parade*, was first issued in 1992, the number as seen in *That’s Entertainment! III*’s collector’s supplement has been improved in sound quality and edited differently from the version seen in the earlier laser disc release. Not only does the new edit use a close-up of Garland not seen earlier, but it also employs other shots different from the earlier montage. This can only lead us to assume that MGM still has the 3-strip Technicolor rushes from which it has been able to restore and recut the sequence. Theories why the marvelously monotonous song was scissored from the picture in 1948 usually repose on her skimpy *un*-turn-of-the-century outfit. But, this cannot be the reason, since Ann Miller’s costume for “Shakin’ The Blues Away” was equally anachronistic and risqué, yet retained. Irving Berlin stated that “it slowed up the picture”.<sup>10</sup> More probable is that the entire sequence is so hesitatingly filmed that it was deemed unfit. “My Intuition” and “March of the Doagies” from *The Harvey Girls* were both issued here before they were re-issued on *The Golden Years*. Long available on LP but never before unlocked from the MGM film vaults are “Last Night When We Were Young”, cut from *In The Good Old Summertime* (1949), along with “I’m An Indian, Too” and “Doin’ What Comes Naturally” from *Annie Get Your Gun* (1949), which Judy never completed.

Harold Arlen’s magnificent “Last Night When We Were Young” was a favorite of Garland’s, but her intense, somber rendition was judged too dark for the light romantic comedy. She would ultimately record the song for Capitol Records in 1956 and perform it on television in 1956 and 1964. “I’m An Indian, Too” and “Doin’ What Comes Naturally” were among the nine titles Judy recorded in March and April 1949 for the Irving Berlin hit, yet the only two musical numbers she filmed. At the end of her rope emotionally, and physically hooked on what she called “her medication”, Judy is far from her best in this penultimate Metro role. Her singing is strident. Visually, Busby Berkeley’s direction is far from cinematic, and he would soon be replaced by George Sidney. This is the first time the Irving Berlin estate has allowed any of *Annie Get Your Gun*, either the Garland footage or the later Betty Hutton version, to be

released. Both of the *Annie Get Your Gun* filmed numbers are included on the compact disc of *That's Entertainment! III*, along with stereo versions of "March of the Doagies" and "Mr. Monotony". On the CD (and analog track of the LD) is the complete version of "Who?", never before released. This extended version was recorded by Judy on October 9, 1945 for inclusion in the Jerome Kern "biopic" *Till The Clouds Roll By* (1946). It was filmed by Vincente Minnelli in an abbreviated form that eliminated the new bridge written especially for Garland by MGM vocal arranger Kay Thompson. Two other titles, "Sunny" and "D'Ye Love Me?", were recorded by Garland and filmed by Minnelli for the same picture, but these have yet to receive a commercial release.

*Summer Stock*, the last of the three films making up *The Golden Years*, is also the last film Garland completed at MGM. Except for "Fall In Love", a deleted Gloria De Haven/Phil Silvers number, and the reprise of "You, Wonderful You", a Garland/Gene Kelly duet, none of the takes are in stereo. Neither do the surviving recording sessions include any alternates or breakdowns, save the two tags on "The Portland Fancy". Even though Saul Chaplin's recent memoirs recount that she did three takes of the great Harold Arlen/Ted Koehler number "Get Happy", only the final one is given here.<sup>11</sup> We must, in fact, pose the question of whether or not these are all prerecordings; many times the slate (the technical countdown before recording) is not heard. Judy's voice was strong and jubilant on the very first session for the film dating from October 13, 1949, during which she laid down Harry Warren's and Mack Gordon's "If You Feel Like Singing, Sing" and "(Howdy Neighbor) Happy Harvest". It was equally relaxed on "Friendly Star", recorded on November 27, 1949. By February 1950 the net deterioration in Judy's voice is audible on "All For You" and "You, Wonderful You". "Get Happy", a take 12 recorded on March 15, 1950, is such an electric number that Judy's illness and drugged state do not detract from her hyper interpretation. This song was her last known recording at Metro, made five months after her first session for the picture. Remembered by all as a long and "difficult" shoot, *Summer Stock* required only five months of prerecordings, whereas *The Pirate* took twelve, thereby somewhat contradicting the former's reputation. Its reputation as being one of Garland's less interesting films is also contradicted by both its commercial success upon release and the renewed reappraisal by film scholars in recent years.<sup>12</sup>

No review of Judy Garland's MGM prerecordings can conclude without mentioning the extraordinary quality of the MGM orchestra, as well as the conductors and the vocal and orchestral arrangers, without whom none of these recordings would have been possible. Today, even less heralded are the recording engineers whose audacious microphone coverage contributes as much as the orchestra in letting us hear the richness of these sophisticated arrangements.

Without today's laser disc technology, the Garland MGM prerecordings would never have been released. Just as the invention of recorded sound or the synchronization of sound and film opened new horizons, the laser disc opens new possibilities of preserving and accessing long dormant archive recordings. The creative and thorough use MGM/UA and Turner have made of this technology can only be heartily applauded and encouraged.

Although it can be regretted that they have not respected the original film size, clipping the left and right sides of the film frame so as to fill a television screen (the proportions of a television screen are different from 35 mm film), the producers must still be praised for giving new life to aging sound recordings. The impeccable care they have put into restoring material often over half a century old is not an act of nostalgia but a declaration of modernity. Avant-garde in practicing multi-channel recording

techniques earlier this century, the roaring lion continues its technologically pioneering leadership at the dawn of the next century.<sup>13</sup>

An artist's career is forcibly concluded by death. After death, what's new is only what's old, and this treasure chest of unheard recordings is necessarily of a fixed number. What is most staggering about the previously unissued Judy Garland recordings made available over the past few years is that instead of the well drying up, it seems like an almost inexhaustible source. One day in the future this will surely end, but until then let us hope that other companies will realize the commercial benefits of protecting and exploiting their archives. *Reviewed by Lawrence Schulman.*

### Endnotes

1. Allen, Bob. "Stereo Sound for Picture" in *Image Technology, Journal of the BKSTS*. August 1989 (Vol. 71, No. 8) and September 1989 (Vol. 71, No. 9). This article contains a complete overview of stereo on film.
2. Although Garland signed with Metro in 1935, her very first feature film, *Pigskin Parade*, was done in 1936 at 20th Century-Fox. MGM lent Garland to Fox, since MGM didn't know just what to do with a chubby adolescent.
3. Walker, Alexander. *The Shattered Silents*. (London: Elm Tree Books, 1978) .
4. Geduld, Harry M. *The Birth of the Talkies*. (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1975).
5. Coleman, Emily R. *The Complete Judy Garland*. (New York: Harper & Row, 1990). This book incorrectly lists The Gumm Sisters' contribution to *Bubbles* as being the song "Lady Luck".
6. Laser disc technology allows for 4 parallel audio channels at the same time: digital left, digital right, analog left, analog right.
7. Henahan, Donal. "Listening for The Trill Of It All". *The New York Times*. Sept. 6, 1987.
8. Wilder, Alec. *American Popular Song*. (New York: Oxford University Press, 1972). This book contains a brief discussion of "The Trolley Song".
9. Altman, Rick. *The American Film Musical*. (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1987). This book contains further discussion of *The Harvey Girls* and *The Pirate*.
10. Fordin, Hugh. *The World of Entertainment*. (New York: Doubleday, 1975), Ch. 7.
11. Chaplin, Saul. *The Golden Age of Movie Musicals and Me*. (Norman, OK: The University of Oklahoma Press, 1994), p. 128.
12. Feuer, Jane. *The Hollywood Musical*. (London: The Macmillan Press/bfi, 1982). This book contains further discussion of *Summer Stock*.
13. Leadership with a little bit of luck - thanks to MGM's being an American company, its video laser discs all have correct recording speeds. This is never the case for PAL or SECAM items released by European companies. It should be remembered that in order to hear the correct speed for a music recording transferred to a video medium, it is always recommended to purchase an NTSC disc, from the USA or Japan, rather than one in PAL from Europe. The problem is that motion pictures run at 24 frames per second whereas videos run faster - 25 frames/second in PAL and SECAM; 30 frames/second in NTSC. For a PAL or SECAM transfer, the film is simply sped up by 1 frame/second, thus making the sound sharper in pitch. For an NTSC transfer, since increasing the film speed from 24 frames/second to 30 is a bit radical,

engineers spread the film out rather than increasing its speed. In a system known as "2 to 3", the first film picture is put on 2 video frames (there are 2 frames in every video picture), the second film picture on 3 video frames, the third film picture on 2 video frames, etc. There is no alteration in

the sound since the film speed is never increased. As such, "The Trolley Song" lasts 4:04 in NTSC and 3:49 in PAL. The only drawback of NTSC is that the picture quality is inferior to PAL or SECAM because there are fewer horizontal lines on the screen.

***Les Grandes Voix du Canada, Volumes IV & V - Chantent Noël (Great Voices of Canada, Volumes IV & V - Sing Christmas Carols)***. Analekta Archives AN 2 7805 and AN 2 7806. (1 CD each).

Gilles St-Laurent and Richard Green, respectively artistic director and sound archives researcher of the National Library of Canada, are responsible for these archival recordings, a specialty of the Montréal-based label Analekta. Both must be commended on this excellent effort. St-Laurent's approach to sound reproduction is unmistakable. Rather than reducing the high frequencies in order to diminish the background noises, he chooses to let "the sound breathe".<sup>1</sup> He believes that one must keep a balance between electronic noise reduction and filtering (removing all that is unpleasant to the ear), and the faithful reproduction of the natural tone and texture of the voices and instruments. This philosophy of minimal alteration is particularly evident on tracks 2, 3, 4, 5, 8 and 20 on the second CD. The surface noises inherent in acoustical and electrical 78s (crackle, hiss, clicks and vibration), caused by normal wear and tear, are unavoidable. St-Laurent has chosen to remove only a minimal amount of high frequency hiss. A producer of archival recordings often must work with shellac pressings of disparate condition. For this reason, many engineers and producers often decide to remove up to two octaves of high frequencies. This central issue dominates all endeavours in the growing field of archival recordings, and a definitive resolution is not in sight. However, for most record buyers and music lovers the only issue is whether or not they like what they hear. I believe that lovers of Christmas songs performed in a variety of styles, sacred and popular, will enjoy these professional yet economical recordings (approximately \$10.00 Canadian per CD).

The listener is immediately struck by the variety of the repertoire and the delightful mood that radiates from most of these thirty-four tracks. Reflecting the bicultural and bilingual nature of Canada, the first CD is dedicated to French-Canadian repertoire, while the second CD concentrates on English-Canadian music. Both CDs include bilingual, six page booklets. All selections are taken from acoustical and electrical recordings which date from 1906 to 1948.

The idea of mixing sacred and popular songs was an excellent one, and only increases the listening pleasure. Included along with sacred perennials such as Adam's "O Holy Night" and Gruber's "Silent Night" are three classic arias from Handel's *Messiah*, the famous Bach-Gounod "Ave Maria", Mozart's melody "Nouvelle agréable", and Gounod's "Noël montez à Dieu". The pop field also receives respectable coverage with seasonal favorites such as the swinging renditions of "Jingle Bells" (in English and in French) and "Winter Wonderland", performed by Canada's legendary Guy Lombardo and his Royal Canadians. Mark Kenney and His Western Gentlemen give a charmingly light and jazzy performance of the much-abused J. S. Pierpont song.

In French Canada, male quartets were once extremely popular, which probably explains the inclusion of six quartet selections. Two selections are performed by a