

Richard Gilbert. The Clarinetists' Solo Repertoire: A Discography. New York: 1972. The Grenadilla Society, P.O. Box 279, New York, N.Y. 10010. Paper, \$8.95.

The discographic aspects of this book are a total botch. The bibliography lacks an entry for the most basic of all discographic reference works: Clough and Cuming's World's Encyclopaedia of Recorded Music. Alas! It proves to be not only omitted, but also ignored.

Furthermore, this book's format is confusing and ambiguous. One entry reads:

SCHUBERT, Franz THE SHEPHERD ON THE ROCK, for
(1797-1826) [sic] Soprano, Clarinet (obbligato)
& Piano, D.965 (Der Hirt auf
dem Felsen)

Amodio	Cetra CC 2153 (78)
Brymer	CLASSICS FOR PLEASURE CFP 166 (Eng)
Deinzer	HARMONIA MUNDI HMS 30696 (G)
Deinzer	RCA VICTOR VICS 1045
De Peyer	ANGEL S-36352/CRT-016
Geuser	DGG 30288 EPL (45 rpm)
Kell	Victor 14815 (78)
P.Mimart	Technicord 1129 (78)
Oppenheim	VICTOR LM 3086 (D)/ RCA Victor 12-0186A (78)
Sobol	CRT-004 (P)
Walton	SAGA STXID 5307
Wolfe	(see Collection)
Wright	COLUMBIA MS 6236

Only the clarinetists are listed. Two recordings each by Geuser, Kell, and Oppenheim exist, but how could a reader tell? The second record is omitted--but which is the second? Soloists and pianists should have been included. My suggested entries:

Geuser, Heinrich; Erna Berger; Ernst-Gunther Scherzer
HMV DB 11569 (78) (G); 7RW 522, E-40996 (45) (G)

Geuser, Heinrich; Rita Streich; Erik Werba
DGG 30288 (45) (G); 18047 (LP); 138 047;
135 007 (ST) (G)

Oppenheim, David; Dorothy Maynor; George Schick
RCA Victor 12-0186 (78); 49-1045 (45);
LM-3086 (LP)

Oppenheim, David; Erna Berger; George Schick

RCA Victor 12-1317/8 in set DM-1423 (78);
49-1372/3 in set WDM 1423 (45)

The Deinzer entries are for the same recording, the Victrola being taken under license from Harmonia Mundi. The Geuser 45 was German only and takes a (G) after the number. The Oppenheim 78 number is side one of a double-faced disc. (A listing elsewhere in the book gives two Cahuzac records by matrix rather than catalog numbers.) Only the latest LP numbers are given, even when the original source was a 78--and since woodwind players are mortal, wouldn't the year of recording be helpful in weighing the state of a particular artist's development? The author's use of prefixes is inconsistent, so the reader cannot determine whether some listings are mono or stereo, and there is no clue whether a record is 10-inch or 12-inch, a single or in an album.

Not only was the existence of W.E.R.M. ignored, but also the output of mail order companies, such as Musical Heritage Society, along with much foreign material, like the wealth of repertoire and performance on Soviet records.

I have a couple of other corrections. The entry for the Draper 10-inch 78 under the Mozart Clarinet Concerto is for the slow movement only. Not listed is the complete version by this most important artist on English Brunswick 20076/8. Mr. Gilbert fails to mention Woody Herman's first version of Stravinsky's Ebony Concerto with the composer conducting; only the later Everest appears. There are many more items which should have been included, but listing them all would mean redoing the whole book.

Private recordings in the author's tape collection are listed as in the entry following "Sobol." It is useful to know of the existence and location of such material, but if such is to be included, these listings could easily be expanded. A check with foreign radio archives would have turned up many important entries, and the various collections of the Library of Congress, many more. Date and place of recording, broadcast or private, is essential information. And I cannot agree that numbers assigned by the author to his own tapes of

commercial records belong in a discography!

The reference "(see Collection)" implies that all items in the separate Collections and Recitals sections are indexed into the main alphabetical listing as well. No such luck! Of the 155 items in this list, 60 make it into the composer section and 95 do not.

One pointless feature is the inclusion of record label photographs--uncaptioned, seemingly chosen at random. They tell nothing discographically, and are not even of very scarce items. The space could have been better used.

It is vital that the regular listings be complete, since the last half of the book is deliberately subjective: various recommended recordings, a retrospective of reviews (often followed by the author's comments), and discussions of major clarinetists and their records. These constitute the only useful part of the book. Mr. Gilbert obviously knows the instrument.

But by omitting so much of importance from the main listings, the author is making further value judgments by concealment--inadvertant though it may be. The user must have full information before him to make buying and listening decisions. How strongly can I state that total and accurate information must be offered in a book pretending to reference quality! The Clarinetist's Solo Repertoire achieves no such standing. Its existence in the limited market for such compilations may well discourage proper treatment of this subject by another hand. Existing stock of this book should be recycled and the job done properly.

Steven Smolian